

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Opoutere Trust	3.1	Oppose	Considers that Firth House at 18 Vera Street should not be included as a heritage building under SCHED1. Disagrees with the Council's heritage assessment that the house is 'largely unmodified'. The house has been extensively remodelled since 1995 under WCC supervision. Little remains from the house's original design. [refer to original submission for full reason]	Remove Item 521 (18 Vera Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Mark Whitaker Levett	7.1	Oppose	Considers that very little of the original heritage features of the building exists anymore. The building has undergone numerous construction changes. [Refer to original submission for full list of changes]. The Historic Heritage Evaluation refers to features that no longer exist on the current building. Earlier WCC assessments have determined the heritage values to be low, and there is nothing in the current assessment that changes this position. Only has a Heritage New Zealand Historic Places Category 2 listing.	Remove Item 524 (134 Willis Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Tony De Lorenzo	9.1	Not specified	Considers that if the PDP is adopted the Council will make ownership of historic properties unaffordable for all except the wealthiest people in Wellington.	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Tony De Lorenzo	9.2	Oppose	Seeks that all heritage listings to 1 Ranfurly Terrace (SCHED1 Item 415) are deleted and this property is given a generic area based heritage listing. Currently listing is unclear and too restrictive, and will incur disproportionate costs to the owners. [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Delete item 415 (1 Ranfurly Terrace) from SCHED1 - Heritage buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Tony De Lorenzo	9.3	Amend	Seeks that the specific listed provisions in column 5 of SCHED1 Item 415 (1 Ranfurly Terrace) are amended (if this listing is not deleted in its entirety). Currently listing is unclear and too restrictive, and will incur disproportionate costs to the owners. [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Amend term 415 (1 Ranfurly Terrace) of SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as follows: Protections Required All of the exterior of the house including the <u>Exterior</u> - facades, roofs <u>roofline</u> , chimneys and chimney pots. All of the front garden including <u>Front garden</u> – masonry front fence, piers, and metal gates; front garden formal layout including edging around planter beds; tiled path; tiled steps to entrance, rendered plinths, and tiled porch floor. Specific items in the rear garden <u>Rear garden</u> - three sections of masonry fence with plinth, bottle balusters, and top rail. The interior of the house including any <u>Interior</u> - including any original lath and plaster walls and ceilings; decorative plasterwork including ceiling roses, cornices and mouldings, and decorative plaster arches; timber floorboards; timber joinery including timber panelled doors, skirting boards, and architraves. (...)
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Rachael Bell and Michael McCormack	15.1	Support	Support the removal of 355 The Parade from the list of heritage buildings. The values that this building was proposed to be scheduled for are seen in other buildings in Wellington.	Retain SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings) as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Amusement Holdings	22.1	Oppose	The portion of the cinema building identified to justify listing does not have sufficient heritage value. Retention and strengthening of this portion of the building compromises redevelopment options, including the continuation of viable cinema activities.	Remove Item 505 (Penthouse Cinema) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.38	Oppose	Opposed to Schedule 1 (Heritage buildings) to the extent that the Wellington Central Library (Te Matapihi) is not included.	Retain SCHED1 - Heritage buildings with amendment.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.39	Amend	Considers that the Wellington Central Library (Te Matapihi) should be included on Schedule 1 (Heritage Buildings) as it has been entered on the NZ Heritage List / Rārangī Kōrero as a Category 1 Historic Place (list number 9761).	Amend SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings to include the Wellington Central Library (Te Matapihi)
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.40	Oppose	Opposed to Schedule 1 (Heritage buildings) to the extent that the McClean Flats are not included.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage Buildings with amendment

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.41	Amend	Considers that Schedule 1 (Heritage Buildings) should include the McLean Flats as it has been entered on the NZ Heritage List / Rārangī Kōrero as a Category 1 Historic Place (list number 9783) in the same listing as the Gordon Wilson Flats which is included in Schedule 1.	Amend SCHED1-Heritage Buildings to include McLean Flats as either a separate listing or as part of the listing of the Gordon Wilson Flats (#299).
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.42	Oppose	Opposed to Schedule 1 (Heritage buildings) to the extent that Hurston House is not included.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage Buildings with amendment
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.43	Amend	Considers that Schedule 1 (Heritage Buildings) should include Hurston House as this building has recently been added to the NZ Heritage List / Rārangī Kōrero as a Category 2 Historic Place (list number 9954).	Amend SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings to include Hurston House
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.44	Oppose in part	Notes that a number of entries in Schedule 1 have incorrect New Zealand Heritage List/Rārangī Kōrero references, and incorrect addresses. Notes several instances where legal descriptions appear to be incorrect.	Seeks that all SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings entries are checked for accuracy in terms of address, legal descriptions and Heritage New Zealand Listing number.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.45	Amend	SCHED1 Item 164.2 has an inaccurate HNZPT # and should be amended.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 164.2 (Cemetery Lychgate) HNZPT # as follows: (HNZPT #) Historic Place Category 2, 1362 1400
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.46	Amend	SCHED1 Item 165 does not have a HNZPT #.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 165 (Jewish Chapel (former)) HNZPT # as follows: (HNZPT #) Historic Place Category 2, 1362
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.47	Amend	The SCHED1 Item 179 address should be amended to 55 Lambton Quay (the official address HNZPT uses for this place).	Amend the SCHED1 Item 179 (Government Buildings) address as follows: (Address) 45 55 Lambton Quay
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.48	Amend	The SCHED1 Item 187 entry incorporates two entries in the NZ Heritage List #212 and #1336 and is missing a NZ Heritage List Entry #.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 187 (Old BNZ Building 2) Historic Place Category 2, 1336
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.49	Amend	The SCHED1 Item 220 address is for the vicarage (94 Hamilton Road) and should be amended to the church (90 Hamilton Road).	Amend the SCHED1 Item 220 (All Saints' Church) address as follows: (Address) 94 90 Hamilton Road
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.50	Amend	The SCHED1 Item 227 legal description should be amended to the legal description for the church and not the hall. The WCC inventory and NZ Heritage List entry refers to the Church, not the hall, and the current legal description refers to the parcel of land where the hall is situated.	Amend SCHED1 Item 227 (St Annes Church) legal description as follows: (Legal Description) Lot 2 DP 82032 – subj to electricity easement Lot 1 DP 90016
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.51	Amend	SCHED1 Item 234 has an inaccurate HNZPT #.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 234 (Wellington Central Fire Station) HNZPT # as follows: (HNZPT #) 3654 3645
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.52	Amend	SCHED1 Item 274 has an inaccurate HNZPT #.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 274 (Missions to Seamen Building) HNZPT # as follows: (HNZPT #) 3411 3611
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.53	Amend	The SCHED1 Item 350 name should be amended to be consistent with SCHED3 Item 12 (St John's Presbyterian Church).	Amend SCHED1 Item 350 (St John's Church) name as follows: (Name) St John's <u>Presbyterian</u> Church
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	70.54	Amend	THE SCHED1 Item 429 address should be amended to 151 Cuba Street as currently it has the same address given to Item 82.2 (Berry Building) 145-149.	Amend the SCHED1 Item 429 (Shop/dwelling) address as follows: (Address) 149 151 Cuba Street
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Tim Bright	75.11	Not specified	No details supplied	[Not specified]

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Ngatiawa Russell Masonic Lodge 345	78.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Lodge) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that the Johnsonville Masonic Hall was purpose built for the use of Freemasons and is of no symbolic, traditional or cultural value to the local Masonic community.</p> <p>The Johnsonville Masonic Hall has little use to the rest of the Johnsonville community and is unlikely to have appeal to other organisations.</p> <p>Including the Hall in the SCHED1 reduces the future development potential of the site and future value of the building in a commercial sense.</p>	Remove Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Hall) from SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings).
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Ian Attwood	79.1	Oppose	<p>Considers that Firth House (Item 521) should not be included in SCHED1 because it has been substantially altered and considers that it does not accurately, authentically, and with fidelity reflect Firth's commitment to social housing design in 1941 for which listing is proposed.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission, including appendices for detailed reasons]</p>	Remove Item 521 (Firth House) from SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings).
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Judith Graykowski	80.13	Not specified	No details supplied	Not specified
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Joanna Newman	85.5	Amend	<p>Considers that the reasons for including these buildings are just as well justified as those that are already listed (Reasons listed in original submission).</p> <p>Considers that 53 Ellice Street and 67 Austin Street were proposed to be included in the Draft District Plan and have been removed in the Proposed District Plan. WCC reassessment documents do not support this decision.</p> <p>[See original submission for further detail]</p> <p>Supports evidence submitted by Mt Victoria Historical Society.</p>	<p>Amend SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings to add the following properties:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 13 Austin Street 67 Austin Street 17 Brougham Street 33 Brougham Street 123 - 125 Brougham Street 136/138 Brougham Street 53 Ellice Street 9 Hawker Street 43 Hawker Street 71 Hawker Street 7 Paterson Street 58 Pirie Street 49 Porritt Avenue 23 Stafford Street 1 Tutchen Avenue 53 Ellice Street 67 Austin Street <p>[See original submission for summary of heritage significance]</p>

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Angus Hodgson & Sebastian Clarke	86.1	Amend	<p>Considers that Boffa Miskell report on pre-1930s Character Area review (2019) identified 61 Hankey Street as being of potential historic significance, and worthy of consideration.</p> <p>Considers that for 61 Hankey Street received New Zealand Institute of Architects Wellington Branch - Enduring Architecture Award 2004.</p> <p>Considers that 61 Hankey Street has significant architectural values.</p> <p>Considers that 61 Hankey Street has many heritage value criteria.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasoning]</p>	Add 61 Hankey Street, Mount Cook to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Te Herenga Waka Victoria University of Wellington	106.27	Support in part	<p>The Wellington Operative District Plan specified the curtilage of the heritage listing under Hunter Building so that works outside of the curtilage are not unnecessarily subject to the heritage rules of the PDP. The Hunter Building should be defined as comprising only the entire external building envelope so as to exclude the interior of the building. The heritage value of the Hunter Building relates only to its external façade and envelope rather than any interior features.</p>	<p>Seeks amendment to Item 171 (Hunter Building, Victoria University) of SCHED1 - Heritage buildings to only include the external building envelope, not the inside of the building as follows:</p> <p>Hunter Building (<u>external building envelope</u>), Victoria University</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Te Herenga Waka Victoria University of Wellington	106.28	Oppose	<p>Considers that the Gordon Wilson Flats have insufficient heritage value to warrant inclusion in the Heritage Schedule.</p> <p>The University also seeks to remove GWF from the Heritage Schedule because:</p> <p>(i) there are no reasonable alternatives to total demolition considering the maintenance, repair and seismic strengthening required;</p> <p>(ii) the building is unusable for any purpose in its present state;</p> <p>(iii) there is no appetite from the University, Council or Housing and Urban Development to repair, refurbish and use the building because it does not fit current needs; and</p> <p>(iv) the cost of refurbishment and conversion to an acceptable design and standard would make such a proposition a financial failure.</p>	Remove Item 299 (Gordon Wilson Flats (Lot 1 DP 363050)) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Te Herenga Waka Victoria University of Wellington	106.29	Oppose	<p>Considers that the Robert Stout Building has insufficient heritage value to warrant inclusion in the Heritage Schedule.</p>	Remove Item 497 (Robert Stout Building (PT TOWN BELT TN OF WELLINGTON)) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Alan Olliver & Julie Middleton	111.9	Support	<p>Supports the heritage listing of all the buildings in Mount Victoria proposed to be included in SCHED1.</p>	Retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified, with respect to any buildings in Mount Victoria

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Alan Olliver & Julie Middleton	111.10	Amend	<p>Considers that additional buildings in Mount Victoria are worthy of heritage listing and should be included in SCHED1.</p> <p>53 Ellice Street and 67 Austin Street were included in the Draft District Plan but are not in SCHED1 of the PDP.</p> <p>Other buildings should be included.</p> <p>67 Austin Street was included in the Draft District Plan but is not in SCHED1 of the PDP.</p>	<p>Add the following buildings to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings:</p> <p>13 Austin Street 67 Austin Street 17 Brougham Street (Owd Trafford) 33 Brougham Street (Hutchinson's House / Women's House) 123-125 Brougham Street (Ionian Flats) 136/138 Brougham Street (Rev Moir's wife's houses) 53 Ellice Street 9 Hawker Street (Hamilton Flats) 43 Hawker Street (Bernard Freyburg's House) 71 Hawker Street (Paterson's House) 7 Paterson Street (William Waring Taylor's House) 58 Pirie Street (George Winder's House) 49 Porritt Avenue (Kate Edger's House) 23 Stafford Street (Wellington Harbour Pilot Holmes's House) 1 Tutchen Avenue (Wellington Harbour Pilot Shilling's House)</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Oliver Sangster	112.18	Oppose	<p>Opposed to the inclusion of the Gordon Wilson Flats on SCHED1-Heritage buildings (# 299).</p> <p>Considers that the flats are an embarrassing and sorry sight in a time when there is a growing problem of homelessness and high rents in Wellington.</p> <p>Considers that the flats need to be demolished to make way for more housing near our city centre and Victoria University.</p> <p>Considers that because they already have Heritage New Zealand protection, further protection under the District Plan is unnecessary.</p>	<p>Seeks that Item 299 - Gordon Wilson Flats be deleted from SCHED1 - Heritage buildings</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Scots College Incorporated	117.10	Oppose	<p>Considers that the maps do not identify the curtilage around the heritage listed main College building in order to limit the application of HH-R4 to the reasonable vicinity of the listed building. Because the Campus is a very large site this change is sought so that resource consent is not unnecessarily required for building work that is sufficiently far away from the main building.</p>	<p>Amend item 219 (Scots' College Main Building) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings by inserting <u>Building curtilage for application of the historic heritage rules is mapped</u> against the item, in a similar manner to the heritage listed Hunter Building on the large Kelburn Campus.</p>

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Singvest Group Limited	129.2	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 522 (154 Victoria Street - Commercial Building) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that the decision to include the Building on Schedule 1 was not conducted fairly or follow due process. [Refer to original submission for comprehensive detailing of process].</p> <p>The comprehensive heritage assessment by heritage expert David Kernohan in 2007 concluded that the recommendation for listing was "unreasonable and should not be sustained".</p> <p>Based on assessments from David Kernohan and Mark Leong (architect), considers that the WCC 2021 Heritage Evaluation Report drew incorrect conclusions which has led to an incorrect assessment that the Building holds significant heritage value.</p> <p>Considers that the impact of the Schedule 1 listing is that SGL will not be able to keep the site commercially viable.</p> <p>With demolition being significantly constrained by a listing, the Building is at risk of becoming uninhabitable after March 2026 as it is also designated as earthquake prone.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments].</p>	Delete Item 522 (154 Victoria Street - Commercial Building) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Andrew Gan	136.1	Amend	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>The church has a long term plan to redevelop the building into a modern complex to suit the needs of the community in the near future. Inclusion in SCHED1 will negatively impact, or even make impossible, future development.</p>	Delete Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Foster+Melville Architects Limited	141.9	Amend	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 514 (28 Robieson Street - Toomath House) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that there are several inaccuracies within the Historic Heritage Evaluation.</p> <p>The house is in need of extensive repairs, maintenance and upgrading and the statement in the Evaluation report that <i>the fabric appears to be sound</i> is incorrect. Significant changes are essential for the survival of the building and to ensure it can continue to serve a useful purpose as a healthy and well-functioning family home. The New Zealand modernist architecture of this house has led to water damage to the property. The building is reasonably intact however several changes have occurred. The neighbouring houses, also designed by Toomath and more refined examples of the architect's design achievements, have not been scheduled.</p> <p>Including the site extent would serve no constructive purpose, creates further challenges for the owners, and prevents alterations that enable appropriate use and enjoyment of indoor-outdoor flow.</p> <p>Considers that the property is not significant for its open plan layout. The study extension, which has significance assigned to it, is an area subsequently destroyed by water damage. Considers that the proposal for listing the exterior is unsubstantiated as much of the evaluation is concerned with the interior. Considers that most of the exterior materials were imported.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons].</p>	Delete Item 514 (28 Robieson Street - Toomath House) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Foster+Melville Architects Limited	141.10	Amend	<p>Considers that other authorities including Auckland Council and Heritage New Zealand, recognise that some buildings are more significant than others. The "blanket" approach taken by Wellington City Council makes it difficult to apply heritage in practice.</p>	Seeks that consideration is given to the ranking of heritage items in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Grant Buchan	143.24	Support	<p>Supports the protection of Heritage Buildings which are excellent examples of their type and are preserved in good and close to original condition.</p>	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Chinese Baptist Church	144.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>The church has a long term plan to redevelop the building and neighbouring properties (i.e. 22, 26, 28 Donald McLean Street) into a complex to service the community better and more widely. Item 490 (24 Donald McLean Street) has the largest area and is located at the centre of the plots and its inclusion in SCHED1 will negatively impact, or even make impossible, future development.</p>	Remove Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Hannah Gao	145.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>The church has a long term plan to redevelop the building into a modern complex to suit the needs of the community in the near future. Inclusion in SCHED1 will negatively impact, or even make impossible, future development.</p>	Remove Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	The Coronation Lodge	149.1	Amend	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Lodge) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that the Johnsonville Masonic Hall was purpose built for the use of Freemasons and is unlikely to have appeal to other organisations.</p> <p>Including the Hall in the SCHED1 reduces the future development potential of the site and future value of the building in a commercial sense.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons].</p>	Delete Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Hall) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Vivienne Morrell	155.16	Support	Supports the heritage listings in the heritage schedules.	Retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified, and include the recommendations of Heritage NZ and Historic Places Wellington.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sophie Kahn	161.4	Oppose	<p>Considers that Kahn House (#520) should not be included on SCHED1-Heritage buildings for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Listing is causing emotional distress. - The house is the submitter's sole asset. - The house needs alterations to modernise it and make it suitable for well-being and safety reasons. -Listing could see significant diminution in capital value - It is very unlikely they will continue to contemplate living in the house if they have their rights to developing the house constrained - It is privately, not publicly owned - The owners agreed to listing the house with Heritage New Zealand due to assurances there would be absolutely no restrictions imposed on the owner as a result of the listing - at the time or in the future. - The house is not Plischke's first construction in New Zealand and it is regarded as being far from his best work. - There is only one room that is 'special' - the living/dining room. - Substantial changes have already been made to the house. - Sufficient examples of Plischke's work, both private and public commissions are already listing by Heritage New Zealand and proposed in the District Plan. - Considers that homes, like humans, are at their best when they are living, breathing, adapting entities. - Concerned about loss of right to privacy of our personal history. - Listing the house in the PDP undermines human rights and renders the house incapable of reasonable use. - Listing can lead to neglect. <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Seeks that Item 520 (Khan House) is removed from SCHED1-Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Stephen Inzon	177.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Lodge) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that the Johnsonville Masonic Hall is significant to the Freemasons community but has little relevance to the rest of the Johnsonville community.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons].</p>	Delete Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Hall) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Tim Appleton	181.1	Oppose	Opposes the inclusion of Item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church, 24 Donald McLean Street) on SCHED1- Heritage Buildings for the following reasons: - considers that more old buildings do not need to be protected in Newtown. -considers more cost effective housing is needed. - considers the owners should be able to decide for themselves whether or not to develop. - considers the buildings next to the church do not have a nice look and are no in keeping with the main church building.	Delete item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church, 24 Donald McLean Street) from SCHED1- Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.36	Support	Supports all proposed listings of historic sites and areas, (including retention of ODP listings) with amendment.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage buildings with amendment.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.37	Amend	Considers that the Wellington Central Library should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Wellington Central Library to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.38	Amend	Considers that Hurston House at 1 Mersey Street, Island Bay, should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Hurston House at 1 Mersey Street Island Bay to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.39	Amend	Considers that Wilkinson holiday flats at 5-7 and 9-11 Grass Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Wilkinson holiday flats at 5-7 and 9-11 Grass Street to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.40	Amend	Considers that Newman House at 15 and 17 Hawkestone Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Newman House at 15 and 17 Hawkestone Street to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.41	Amend	Considers that Samuel Brown House at 22 Hanson Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Samuel Brown House at 22 Hanson Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.42	Amend	Considers that Burns Upholsterer at 47-49 Martin Square should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Burns Upholsterer at 47-49 Martin Square to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.43	Amend	Considers that Coffey House at 230 Oriental Parade should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add Coffey House at 230 Oriental Parade to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Historic Places Wellington	182.44	Amend	Considers that The Salvation Army Citadel on Jessie Street be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings. [See original submission for full reasons]	Add The Salvation Army Citadel on Jessie Street to SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings.

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Shirley Smith Family Trust	187.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the inclusion of Item 519 (Sutch-Smith House, 79A Todman Street) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.</p> <p>Considers that the Historic Heritage listing will have a detrimental effect on the overall value of property while achieving no real benefit to it. The listing imposes potential financial harm on the beneficiaries without realistically protecting the house in any meaningful way.</p> <p>Considers that the house is better protected by the will of the family and the Trust than by a Heritage listing. The family are deeply committed to the house and would never alter its exterior fabric further than it has already been altered. Nor would they pass it on to someone who didn't share their commitment.</p>	Delete Item 519 (Sutch-Smith House, 79A Todman Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Nicola Crauford	208.1	Amend	<p>Considers that the house has been altered far beyond its original design in order to meet the needs of modern living.</p> <p>Considers that the original design and concepts have been well preserved.</p> <p>Considers that the house no longer represents those original concepts and designs.</p>	Remove Item 521 (18 Vera Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Mount Victoria Historical Society	214.11	Support	Supports all current buildings listed in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings in mount Victoria	<p>Retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.</p> <p>[Inferred decision requested]</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Mount Victoria Historical Society	214.12	Amend	<p>Considers that the reasons for including these buildings are just as well justified as those that are already listed (Reasons listed in original submission).</p> <p>Considers that 53 Ellice Street and 67 Austin Street were proposed to be included in the Draft District Plan and have been removed in the Proposed District Plan. WCC reassessment documents do not support this decision.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	<p>Amend SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings to add the following properties:</p> <p>13 Austin Street 67 Austin Street 17 Brougham Street 33 Brougham Street 123 - 125 Brougham Street 136/138 Brougham Street 53 Ellice Street 9 Hawker Street 43 Hawker Street 71 Hawker Street 7 Paterson Street 58 Pirie Street 49 Porritt Avenue 23 Stafford Street 1 Tutchen Avenue 53 Ellice Street 67 Austin Street</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for summary of heritage significance]</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Mike Camden	226.7	Support	Supports the heritage schedule and new listings, but considers that consultation with community groups and NZIA and a public process for selecting new listings would have been preferable.	Retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.26	Support	Supports all proposed listings of historic sites and areas, (including retention of ODP listings) with amendment.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage buildings with amendment
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.27	Support	Supports all proposed listings of historic sites and areas, (including retention of ODP listings) with amendment.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage buildings with amendment

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.28	Amend	Considers that the Wellington Central Library should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Wellington Central Library to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.29	Amend	Considers that Hurston House at 1 Mersey Street, Island Bay, should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Hurston House at 1 Mersey Street Island Bay to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.30	Amend	Considers that Wilkinson holiday flats at 5-7 and 9-11 Grass Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Wilkinson holiday flats at 5-7 and 9-11 Grass Street to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.31	Amend	Considers that Newman House at 15 and 17 Hawkestone Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Newman House at 15 and 17 Hawkestone Street to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.32	Amend	Considers that Samuel Brown House at 22 Hanson Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Samuel Brown House at 22 Hanson Street should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.33	Amend	Considers that Burns Upholsterer at 47-49 Martin Square should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Burns Upholsterer at 47-49 Martin Square to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.34	Amend	Considers that Coffey House at 230 Oriental Parade should be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add Coffey House at 230 Oriental Parade to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.35	Amend	Considers that The Salvation Army Citadel on Jessie Street be included on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Add The Salvation Army Citadel on Jessie Street to SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington's Character Charitable Trust	233.36	Amend	Supports evidence submitted by Historic Places Wellington.	Seeks that additional heritage listings are added for decorative/coloured glass.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Cherie Jacobson	251.8	Support	Supports all historic heritage added to the schedules.	Retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Graeme Webster	255.1	Oppose	Considers that Toomath House is a private dwelling with little to no historic or heritage value. The site is not visible from the road. Heritage status would impose an unfair financial burden on the owners. Considers that it is unreasonable to list a property as heritage status without owners consent.	Remove item 514 (28 Robieson Street, Toomath House) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Graeme Webster	255.2	Support	Considers that 26 Robieson Street is a private dwelling with little to no historic or heritage value. The site is not visible from the road. Heritage status would impose an unfair financial burden on the owners. Considers that it is unreasonable to list a property as heritage status without owners consent.	Seeks that 26 Robieson Street is not identified as a heritage building (as notified) and is not entered onto SCHED1-Heritage buildings in the future. [Inferred decision requested]
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Johnsonville Masonic Hall	263.1	Amend	Considers that Freemasons Hall has little relevance to Johnsonville Community and that this building should not be included in the heritage schedule. [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Remove Item 366 (Johnsonville Masonic Hall) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington City Council	266.180	Amend	[No specific reason given beyond decision requested - see original submission for further reason]	Seeks to re-order Schedule 1 alphabetically by street name.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington City Council	266.181	Amend	Considers 'Willowgrove' has been identified as having significant heritage values and meets the Councils criteria for listing in the District Plan. The owner has been active in supporting its listing.	Add 'Willowgrove' to SCHED1 (Heritage buildings) as follows: <u>Address: 17 Parkvale Road, Karori</u> <u>Name: Willowgrove</u> <u>Legal Description: Lot 2 DP 44016</u> <u>Protection Required: Entire external building envelope</u> <u>Values: A, B, C, E, F</u>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington City Council	266.182	Amend	Considers the Tea Rooms and Bakehouse (former) has been identified as having significant heritage values and meets the Councils criteria for listing in the District Plan. The owner has been active in supporting its listing.	Add 'Tea Rooms and Bakehouse' (former) to SCHED1 (Heritage buildings) as follows: <u>Address: 249-261 Mansfield Street, Newtown</u> <u>Name: Tea Rooms and Bakehouse (former)</u> <u>Legal Description: Part Section 875 TN of Wellington</u> <u>Protection Required: Entire external building envelope</u> <u>Values: A, B, C, E, F</u>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	CAMJEC Commercial Limited	268.1	Oppose	Opposes the site at 233 Willis Street being included in SCHED1 - Heritage buildings on the basis that this building does not meet the requirements to be listed as a Heritage item [Refer to original submission for full reason].	Seeks to remove item 525 (233 Willis Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Aimee Poy	272.1	Oppose	Opposes the church at 24 Donald McLean Street being included in SCHED1 - Heritage buildings. Considers that significant changes of appearance of the church building in the future can't be made. If it is heritage listed then the Church will not be able to carry out its vision for the future and serve the local community. The neighbouring properties adjacent to the Church will also be affected as this will significantly alter the development potential.	Remove item 490 (Former Primitive Methodist Church) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Julie-Anne Daysh	330.1	Oppose	Opposes heritage listing of Item 525 at 233 Willis Street. Resource consents (SRs 496847 & 499648) have been granted to build apartment buildings on the site, namely at Part Lot 7, DP 557, and Lot 1 and 2 DP 5171, and Lot 1 DP 2988. [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Delete Item 525 (233 Willis Street) from SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings) in its entirety.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Mt Cook Mobilised	331.22	Amend	There are multiple reasons why the consideration of scheduling 61 Hankey Street is warranted. This includes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Boffa Miskell report on pre-1930s Character Area review (2019) identified 61 Hankey Street as being of potential historic significance, and worthy of consideration • New Zealand Institute of Architects Wellington Branch – Enduring Architecture Award 2004 for 61 Hankey Street. <p>The owners have presented their summary statement of significance could be: 61 Hankey Street has significant architectural values within the Wellington region as a fine example of an intact, single-detached modernist house, designed by prominent Wellington architects Bill Toomath and Derek Wilson.</p>	Amend SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings) to include 61 Hankey Street.

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Cho Yam Chan	335.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes heritage listing of Item 525 at 233 Willis Street. The theme and integrity of the original design of 233 Willis Street has been lost, as the front showroom which protruded out from the front of building was destroyed during the Willis Street road widening. There is limited community recognition of the site, as there are only 2 photos of the building on the NZ Archive website. There are other Anscombe buildings in the heritage list worth preserving.</p> <p>NBS rating is at 34%, which would need to be raised through strengthening. Strengthening would require further capital investment in the vicinity of a few millions, which is more than the value of the building improvement value.</p> <p>The site is also suited for apartment development. The economic value lies in the land. The best return value on investment and best use of the site is apartments/residential development with commercial units at ground level.</p>	Delete Item 525 (233 Willis Street) from SCHED1 (Heritage Buildings) in its entirety.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wayne Coffey and Gregory Young	347.1	Amend	<p>Considers that Schedule 1 (Heritage Buildings) should include the Salvation Army Citadel building on Jessie Street. The building has special architectural, social and cultural heritage significance. The Citadel was purpose built as a place of community gathering and worship for a noteworthy group, the Salvation Army. Salvation Army activity on the site dates back over 100 years. It was the home of the world renowned Wellington Citadel Salvation Army Band for more than 125 years. Wellington city is in need of a medium sized performance venue and the Citadel would be suitable for that purpose. The quality space has excellent features for public performance. [Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Amend SCHED1-Heritage Buildings to include the Salvation Army Citadel building on Jessie Street.

Sub-part / Chapter /Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wharenui Apartments Ltd	358.3	Oppose in part	<p>Considers that the Wharenui Apartments at 274 Oriental Parade (Item 509) should not be listed under SCHED1. The entire external building envelope has been assessed and listed on the heritage building list. The leasehold company that owns the apartments do not support this listing. A heritage listing imposes significant costs and restrictions on the maintenance of the building. The heritage values of the building are not considered to warrant additional costs and restrictions linked to the listing. The heritage values listed in Item 509 predominantly relate to value associated with the site, not the actual building. The architectural style of the building is less coherent than suggested by officers and does not warrant listing. The listing is considered to not be a sustainable allocation of resources.</p> <p>Detailed counterpoints to heritage values listed in Item 509 are provided. Namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adjacent buildings were completed in the late 1930s and early 40s and arguably influenced the modernist movement more than Wharenui apartments. - The building's architects have worked on a great number of buildings within Wellington. - The heritage status is only applied to the exterior of the building envelope, which is already protected in an archaeological sense since it is listed on the archaeological alert layer. - Despite having a unique outward design, the scale and materials of the building are not unique for the area. - The building was completed in 1958, 30 to 40 years apart from the first modern apartment towers in the area, which are not listed as heritage buildings. - The building's 15m setback makes it hidden from the street. - Minor maintenance has occurred and will need to occur in the future due to the material state of the building and its location being near the beach. - The modernist architectural style and multi-use development is already represented within Oriental Bay. <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Item 509 (274 Oriental Parade) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wharenui Apartments Ltd	358.4	Amend	<p>Considers that the Wharenui Apartments at 274 Oriental Parade (Item 509) should not be listed under SCHED1. The entire external building envelope has been assessed and listed on the heritage building list. The leasehold company that owns the apartments do not support this listing. A heritage listing imposes significant costs and restrictions on the maintenance of the building. The heritage values of the building are not considered to warrant additional costs and restrictions linked to the listing. The heritage values listed in Item 509 predominantly relate to value associated with the site, not the actual building. The architectural style of the building is less coherent than suggested by officers and does not warrant listing. The listing is considered to not be a sustainable allocation of resources.</p> <p>Detailed counterpoints to heritage values listed in Item 509 are provided. Namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adjacent buildings were completed in the late 1930s and early 40s and arguably influenced the modernist movement more than Wharenui apartments. - The building's architects have worked on a great number of buildings within Wellington. - The heritage status is only applied to the exterior of the building envelope, which is already protected in an archaeological sense since it is listed on the archaeological alert layer. - Despite having a unique outward design, the scale and materials of the building are not unique for the area. - The building was completed in 1958, 30 to 40 years apart from the first modern apartment towers in the area, which are not listed as heritage buildings. - The building's 15m setback makes it hidden from the street. - Minor maintenance has occurred and will need to occur in the future due to the material state of the building and its location being near the beach. - The modernist architectural style and multi-use development is already represented within Oriental Bay. <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Item 509 (274 Oriental Parade) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wētā FX	364.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the Heritage listing of Item 511 (139 Park Road) in SCHED1 - Heritage buildings. Weta FX has identified this location as the only one fitting the unique attributes they need to increase their crew members and provide work spaces for them in Miramar.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Opposes 139 Park Road, Miramar being included in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings (Item 511).
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wētā FX	364.2	Amend	<p>Opposes the Heritage listing of Item 511 (139 Park Road) in SCHED1 - Heritage buildings. Weta FX has identified this location as the only one fitting the unique attributes they need to increase their crew members and provide work spaces for them in Miramar.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Item 511 (139 Park Road) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Argosy Property No. 1 Limited	383.125	Support	<p>Argosy's property at 15 Stout Street is recognised as a heritage building as the 'Department Building'. The entire external building envelope is listed.</p>	Retain Schedule 1 - Heritage Buildings, Ref 23 as notified.

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Argosy Property No. 1 Limited	383.126	Amend	<p>The former State Insurance Building comprises the first eight floors of the building. In 1998, a three storey addition designed by Athfield Architects, was constructed on top of the former State Insurance Building (Athfield Addition). Argosy opposes the Athfield addition being included in the listing of the State Insurance Building for the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Wellington City Council Heritage Inventory describes the history, architectural information and cultural value of the building. The Heritage Inventory's recognition of the heritage values of the building is limited to the former State Insurance Building. It describes the Athfield Addition as "a large and somewhat incongruous" addition. - Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga lists the former State Insurance Office Building on the New Zealand Heritage List/Rarangi Korero.² The building was registered on the New Zealand Heritage List/Rarangi Korero in 1981 (before the Athfield Addition was constructed) and the listing describes the former State Insurance Office Building and not the Athfield Addition. - A heritage order was issued in relation to the State Insurance Building on 29 September 1987. Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga is the heritage protection authority in relation to this heritage order. Because the heritage order was issued before the Athfield Addition was constructed, the Council is not restricted by the requirements in s 195A of the Resource Management Act 1991 in relation to altering the heritage listing of the building in the Proposed Plan to exclude the Athfield Addition. - The Athfield Addition does not have any heritage value and should be excluded from the heritage listing of 143 Lambton Quay in the Draft Plan. It is not appropriate for this addition to be subject to the controls of being a heritage building in the Proposed Plan when it has no heritage value and can be easily distinguished from the former State Insurance Building. 	<p>Amend Schedule 1, DP Ref 181:</p> <p>Entire external building envelope of former State Insurance Building. <u>Listing excludes the 1998 three-storey addition designed by Athfield architects.</u></p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Argosy Property No. 1 Limited	383.127	Support	Argosy's property at 360-366 Lambton Quay is recognised as including two heritage buildings: the 'Equitable Building and Investment Co. Building' and 'Stewart Dawson's Corner'. The entire external building envelope is listed in relation to both buildings.	Retain the Schedule 1 - Heritage buildings listings for Ref 191.1 and 191.2 as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Civic Trust	388.119	Support in part	SCHED1 is partially supported and additional Heritage Buildings are proposed.	Retain Schedule 1 - Heritage Buildings with amendment.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Civic Trust	388.120	Amend	Considers that SCHED1 should include the Michael Fowler Centre, the Municipal Office Building, the Civic Administration Building and Wellington Public Library. These buildings should be identified as having heritage values within the Te Ngākau Civic Square Precinct.	<p>Amend Schedule 1 - Heritage Buildings to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Michael Fowler Centre, - The Municipal Office Building, - The Civic Administration Building, - Wellington Public Library.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Grace Ridley-Smith	390.9	Amend	Supports the heritage scheduling of additional sites identified by Historic Places Wellington.	Seeks that the Heritage Buildings identified by the Historic Places Wellington submission are listed in SCHED3 - Heritage Areas. (Historic Places Wellington Submission 182).
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Murray Pillar	393.20	Support in part	Supports the WCC proposals for retaining existing, and adding new, listed heritage buildings.	Retain all existing and new Items in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Murray Pillar	393.21	Amend	[No specific reason given beyond decision requested - refer to original submission].	Seeks that the selection of new listings for SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings involved greater consultation with Historic Places Wellington and other community groups, and to have been a public process.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Heritage Professionals	412.101	Support in part	Support the new additions to the schedule of historic heritage items, but considers that they are not representative of what is distinctive about Wellington, the region, and New Zealand.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage buildings as notified, with amendments [Inferred decision requested]

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Heritage Professionals	412.102	Amend	Considers that the Heritage items schedule does not adequately protect historic heritage nor reflect what Wellingtonians value. Considers that the schedule will not meet objective HH-O1. [Refer to original submission for full reason]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Heritage Professionals	412.103	Support	Supports the addition of new places to the schedule but concerned that the lack of public engagement on the review of the schedule will undermine its efficacy as it is unlikely to have the support of the people of Wellington as it does not reflect Wellington's important heritage.	[Inferred decision requested] retain SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wellington Heritage Professionals	412.104	Oppose	Does not support the protection of facades only where heritage fabric exists in addition to the facade and considers that this is likely to lead to adverse effects on heritage.	Not specified
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	VicLabour	414.60	Oppose in part	Considers The Gordon Wilson flats are an example of where heritage protection has gotten in the way of the city's priorities.	Not specified
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.12	Oppose	The Heritage Building listing of 28 Robieson Street is opposed. Considers the house is deemed to be in poor condition and remediation work is estimated to cost as much as \$800 - \$1million. Detailed renovations plans from the owners have been provided, which include repurposing the timber from the house and other special aspects of the building. Considers a heritage listing on the property would incur risks, costs and stress to the owners, who wish to renovate the house. It is argued that the heritage value of the building is low, and that the listing would not result in any positive net benefits for society or the owners. It is considered that the listing would instead lead to a worse heritage outcome for the community due to the significant impacts on the owners linked to the condition of the building. [Refer to original submission for full reason, including attachments]	Delete Item 514 (28 Robieson Street) from SCHED1 - Heritage Building.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.31	Not specified	Considers that the Council failed to meet the NZ Treasury's expected standards of good regulatory practice with their proposal, evidence base and evaluation of options to list 28 Robieson Street as a Heritage Building. The New Zealand Treasury sets expectations for good regulatory practice, stating that net benefits need to be considered, that regulated parties should be treated fairly and the Council should seek to meet their objectives in a way that has the least impact on property rights, market competition and individual autonomy. For instance, the Treasury's guidance report 'Best Practice Monitoring and Review' (2019) suggests that 5 to 10 per cent of the total time and budget committed to an intervention should be spent on review, monitoring and evaluation. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Seeks that the Council meets the New Zealand Treasury standards and guidelines on regulatory practice, monitoring and review in regard to listing 28 Robieson Street as a heritage building. [Inferred decision requested]
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.32	Not specified	Considers the evidence base for the historic heritage section of the section 32 evaluation is weak in regard to heritage listing of 28 Robieson Street. Has concerns with low-quality analysis, considers some reports do not exist, some are still draft reports, some are missing content, and some are summer student projects. The low quality of these reports implies the Council was never expecting to be asked to provide evidence. Any evidence used to form proposals of this scale and significance needs to have a level of detail and analytical rigour that is commensurate to the impacts in addition to transparency, and the findings being clearly documented. Considers some reports which form the evidence base are also not publicly available. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Seeks that the evidence base for the historic heritage section of the Section 32 have a level of detail and analytical rigour that is commensurate to the impacts in addition to being transparent, and the findings being clearly documented. [Inferred decision requested]

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.33	Not specified	Considers that council has failed to have an effective and unbiased process to identify heritage. Considers the identification process used by Council lacks the detail and rigour that corresponds to the scale and significance of the proposal to list 28 Robieson Street. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.34	Not specified	Considers there is little evidence to support modernist architecture being under-represented in the heritage schedule being used as a reason to list 28 Robieson Street. Considers that there are modernist buildings that are not classified as modernist by Council already listed and that no consideration has been given to modernist representation across the Greater Wellington region. Considers it is unreasonable for the Council to claim the architectural theme of modernism is under-represented, if classification is lacking or undefined. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.35	Not specified	Considers that the Pukehinau flats are modernist flats with distinctive round windows at the bottom of Brooklyn hill are easily viewably by the public. The flats are owned and managed by the Council. This imposing building has similarities to other notable architects of the era. The flats are unlisted and unfortunately, they were documented as being in poor condition in 2017. Queries why some buildings and architects attract attention but others do not and notes Burren and Keen largely appear to be ignored in the literary history and heritage of the city. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.36	Not specified	Considers that Toomath house has very low community amenity value and option use value. Since the owners have bought the house in 2014, there has been no requests to visit or tour the house. It is considered that the highest actual use value attained from private homes, and from Toomath house, is from living in them. [Refer to original submission for full reasons, including attachments]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Sarah Cutten and Matthew Keir	415.37	Not specified	A registered valuation of Toomath House (28 Robieson Street) has assessed that the property will have a 29% drop in value as a result of a Heritage Listing, amounting to a loss of \$450,000. This will impact the owners' financial wellbeing, security, and retirement plans. It is also considered that the home is in poor condition, costs to remediate are high and there is uncertainty and list with the property being heritage listed. [Refer to original for full reason, including Appendix A]	Not specified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Fabric Property Limited	425.111	Support	Acknowledges the building at 22 The Terrace is recognised as a heritage building. The entire external building envelope is listed.	Retain item 287 in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Wingnut PM Ltd	428.1	Amend	Considers that The Former School and Convent have little to no architectural merit, has been altered many times, and is poor build quality. Preservation while developing for future use would be difficult. Considers that expansion of the Post Production Music composing and recording base would be difficult. [See original submission for full reasons]	Amend Item 120 in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings to remove The Former School and Convent 1899. [See original submission for map of building]
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Rachel Underwood	458.12	Support	Supports the Council's proposals for retaining existing, and adding new, listed Heritage Buildings but considers a public process should have been followed to select them with consultation with Heritage Places Wellington and community groups.	Retain SCHED1- Heritage buildings, as notified. [Inferred decision requested]

Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings

Sub-part / Chapter / Provision	Submitter Name	Sub No / Point No	Position	Summary of Submission	Decisions Requested
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Philip Cooke	465.4	Amend	<p>Considers that Item 471 (20 Austin Street) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings is highly modified from the original Victorian building and relies on the surrounding buildings for scale and context.</p> <p>Considers that 20 Austin Street's contribution to the townscape is not in isolation nor is it held in high public esteem by the local community without the context of the surrounding buildings.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons].</p>	Seeks that Item 471 (20 Austin Street) is only included as a listed Item on SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings if the surrounding buildings are included within the Character Precinct boundary.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Philip Cooke	465.5	Oppose in part	<p>Considers that 20 Austin Street's contribution to the townscape is not in isolation nor is it held in high public esteem by the local community without the context of the surrounding buildings.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reasons].</p>	<p>Remove Heritage Building Item 471 (20 Austin Street) in its current form.</p> <p>[inferred decision requested]</p>
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	WingNut Films Productions Limited	467.1	Oppose	<p>Oppose the heritage listing of the Bulk Storage Tank at 139 Park Road.</p> <p>Considers that the tank is predominantly a steel structure and has significant rust. The roof has a large number of leaks and significant amounts of water come into the building whenever it rains. The tank also has a condensation problem which makes it unsuitable for the vast majority of activities.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Heritage listing 511 - 139 Park Road from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Olympus Apartments	473.1	Oppose	<p>Opposes the proposed heritage designation of the Olympus Apartments.</p> <p>Considers that the added cost of any improvements or maintenance if the building is designated historic is concerning, especially as many owners are retired and on fixed incomes.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Heritage Listing 510 (280 Oriental Parade) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Olympus Apartments	473.2	Amend	<p>Considers 280 Oriental Parade does not qualify as a Listed Heritage Building.</p> <p>[Refer to original submission for full reason]</p>	Remove Heritage Listing 510 (280 Oriental Parade) from SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Craig Palmer	492.50	Amend	<p>Considers that SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings should be amended so that the Item List is aggregated into defined areas of the city.</p> <p>This is to enable the public to readily access a definitive list for the neighbourhood where they live and other areas of interest.</p>	Seeks that the Items List in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings are aggregated into defined areas of the city.
Schedules Subpart / Schedules / SCHED1 – Heritage Buildings	Rita Angus Cottage Trust (formerly Thorndon Trust)	494.2	Support	Supports the inclusion of Item 470 (Cooper's Cottage) in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings.	Retain Item 470 as a listed building in SCHED1 - Heritage Buildings as notified.