
SECTION 32 REPORT

PROPOSED PLAN CHANGE 64 (Kiwi Point Quarry Extension, Ngauranga Gorge)

1. Introduction

Section 32 of the Resource Management Act stipulates a requirement that, in achieving the purpose of the Act, a decision maker must consider alternatives and assess the benefits and costs of adopting any objective, policy, rule, or method in the District Plan. Under section 32(3) the assessment must examine:

- (a) *the extent to which each objective is the most appropriate way to achieve the purpose of this Act: and*
- (b) *whether, having regard to their efficiency and effectiveness, the policies, rules, or other methods are the most appropriate for achieving the objectives.*

A report summarising a section 32 evaluation and giving reasons for the evaluation must be available for public inspection at the same time as public notification.

2. Process & Consultation

The evaluation has taken into account environmental, social and economic impacts in terms of the city and region, and has been the subject of a consultative process.

2.1 Background

The present Kiwi Point Quarry has operated in Ngauranga Gorge for many years. The location has experienced many decades of quarrying activity which has enabled not only the development of the City by providing a rock resource, but has also assisted the development of efficient and effective transport links between the City and wider Wellington Region. The Ngauranga Gorge is a highly modified landscape, but nevertheless has qualities and characteristics which mean that further quarry development must be carefully evaluated, and undertaken in a managed way that includes rehabilitation of the quarried area.

In 2004, Plan Changes 25 and 26 were approved by the Wellington City Council for the extension of the Kiwi Point Quarry to the south, including the modification of some of the quarry boundaries. The process to reach the stage for a proposed Plan Change comprised some six years of investigations, with the area identified as suitable for expansion being zoned as Open Space B and partly Suburban Centre. The quarry extension required a change and clarification of policy, a plan map change and new rules and methods.

2.2 Key documents

The following documents and processes are referenced with regards to proposed Plan Change 64.

- 1. Wellington City Council District Plan.** Prepared by Wellington City Council (June 2000).
- 2. Quarry Management Plan Kiwi Point Quarry.** Prepared by Opus (March 2006).
- 3. Rehabilitation Plan.** Prepared by Boffa Miskell. (April 2005).
- 4. Cultural Impact Assessment (Draft)** Prepared by Liz Mellish, Wellington Tenth Trust (October 2003).

2.3 Consultation, in accordance with the First Schedule of the RMA 1991

Details and the draft Plan Change documentation were sent out to the following adjoining property owners:

- Phillip & Debra Goodwin 9 Plumer Street, Johnsonville
- Anthony & Brenda Norton 14 Plumer Street, Johnsonville
- Kathleen Edith Major 73 Tarawera Road, Johnsonville
- Glenda Oben & Dougal McQueen 75 Tarawera Road, Johnsonville
- Neville Janus Baay 86 Tarawera Road, Johnsonville
- 84 Tarawera Road, Johnsonville
- Megan Lee Hurnard 113 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville
- Sanctuary On Fraser Ltd 130 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville
- Wellington Education Trust 170 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville
- Malvina Major Retirement Village 146 Burma Road, Johnsonville
- K Palmer, J Taylor & M Burrowes 175 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville

Details and the draft Plan Change documentation were also sent out the following statutory parties:

- Ministry for the Environment
- Department of Conservation
- Greater Wellington Regional Council
- Wellington Tenth Trust
- Te Runanga O Toa Rangatira Inc

2.4 Responses from Adjoining Landowners

To date, the Council has received comments from the following adjoining landowners:

- Mr Stuart Haselden, the owner of 130 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville, raised the following points:
 - That the buffer zone is important for his property and development.
 - The timeframe for blasting is too long, and should be decreased to between 9.00am – 12.00pm or something similar.
 - The current view from his property is not pleasant. He would like trees to be planted around the roadway to screen the quarry. Mr Haselden made the point that the planting of trees would not create a visual block to other properties as this area of land is lower lying.
 - Possible inappropriate land uses on leased quarry land neighbouring his property
 - Traffic safety issues on Fraser Avenue.

- Ms Megan Hurnard, the owner of 113 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville, made the following comments:
 - That the timeframe for blasting is too long and should be reduced. Ms Hurnard suggested a morning period and an afternoon period within which blasting can be undertaken. For example the hours between 10.00am – 11.00am and 1.00pm – 2.00pm.
 - She also raised the point that she does not receive any notification as to when blasting is proposed to be undertaken even though her property adjoins the site.
 - Ms Hurnard mentioned that she would like the gorse on the quarry adjacent to her property cleared, and trees planted.
 - Although outside the scope of the proposed plan change, she also wanted to discuss the potential for acquiring an easement on the southern boundary of their site which falls within Wellington City Council owned Open Space land, situated at the north-western most corner of the quarry. This information has been passed on to the relevant Council business unit.
 - Another peripheral request to the proposed plan change was that speeding vehicles have become a nuisance on Fraser Avenue. Ms Hurnard said that speed bumps should be considered for the area, or further widening and parking restrictions be created. This matter has also been passed on to the relevant Council business unit.

- Mr Phil Goodwin, the owner of 9 Plumer Street, Johnsonville, made the following comments:
 - The reduction in the width of the buffer zone adjacent to his property under the new provisions. Mr Goodwin seeks assurance that any work undertaken in such close proximity will be carried out in a safe and appropriate manner.
 - Mr Goodwin noted that the overland flow path in which stormwater runs from Plumer Street, runs down his property toward the north face, which could compound slope instability in the area.

- He noted there had been an issue of dust nuisance in the past. Specifically when quarry activities were being undertaken on the north face during a southerly, causing dust clouds that settled in and around his house. It is noted that operations ceased some 20 minutes after Mr Goodwin had called the quarry operator.
- Mr Keith Palmer, the owner of 175 Fraser Avenue, Johnsonville, made the following comments:
 - Whether the spine of land close to Mr Palmer's property was included in the Plan Change. It was noted however that the spine is included in Area C which is already approved for quarrying and cleanfilling under the District Plan.
 - With regards to the removal of the spine (which is permitted under the District Plan), Mr Palmer voiced his opposition to the increased view of the quarry floor that will result through the removal of the spine, but understood it was a permitted activity under the District Plan. Mr Bouzaid suggested the potential for adverse visual effects could be mitigated through the planting of trees.
 - Mr Palmer was also concerned about traffic and access with the introduction of the north-western corner (some of which is proposed to be leased by Council). Mr Palmer stated that he would be interested in gaining a new access to his property from the quarry road, which is situated along the north-eastern boundary of his site. This is so that access to his property does not have to be gained over the existing railway line.
 - Mr Palmer would like to be kept updated with all future planning of the quarry and adjacent area, especially with regards to obtaining access to his property from the quarry.

2.5 Responses from Statutory Authorities

To date, the Council received comments from the following statutory authority:

- Wellington Tenth's Trust

Initial conversations were held with Liz Mellish from the Wellington Tenth's Trust. Ms Mellish stated that the Trust had two main concerns with regards to the proposed plan change. These issues are as follows:

 - *The Stream*

It is acknowledged that iwi have strong cultural ties with the Ngauranga Stream that flows through the site, and that iwi would like it protected. Ms Mellish stated that the Wellington Tenth's Trust would be opposed to the piping of the stream. She also stated that no debris as a result of additional quarrying activities should be discharged into the stream.
 - *Visual Effects*

Ms Mellish stated that in order for the Trust to provide their written approval to the proposed plan change, in addition to the comments raised above regarding the stream, assurances must be provided to ensure that there will be no long term visual effects from the sea when looking up Ngauranga Gorge towards the quarry.

2.6 Council's Response

In answer to responses received from the parties consulted with, the Council reduced the hours in which blasting can take place from between 9.00am and 3.00pm which was initially proposed, to between 10.00am and 2.00pm.

With regards to the concerns raised by the Wellington Tenth Trust, the stream has been identified as an area requiring future rehabilitation. The eventual rehabilitation of the stream will be undertaken in consultation with the appropriate parties, including the Wellington Tenth Trust, before specific rehabilitation is initiated under the annual implementation plan. Section 7 of the Quarry Management Plan indicates that rehabilitation of the stream should address the removal of industrial waste from the streambed and slopes, diversion and treatment of contaminated runoff, re-grading of the streambed, pest plant removal and the enhancement of riparian re-vegetation.

The overall objective of the rehabilitation of the Kiwi Point Quarry is to be accordance with Council's policy, in particular *Capital Spaces, Open Space Strategy for Wellington City (November 1998)*, which requires native vegetation to be established that contributes to the Council's vision for Ngauranga Gorge to become part of the identified inner green belt. Through the re-establishment of vegetation within the Kiwi Point Quarry site, the visual effects of the Ngauranga Gorge when viewed from the harbour will effectively be enhanced.

3. Resource Management Act Context

The purpose of the Resource Management Act 1991 (the Act) is to promote the sustainable management of natural and physical resources. Sustainable management includes managing the use, development and protection of natural and physical resources to enable people and communities to provide for their social, economic and cultural well being and their health and safety. The proposed Plan Change to extend the boundaries of the quarry, including the rezoning of a number of areas, and the realignment of the District Plan with the provisions set out in the current Quarry Management Plan, will enable the ongoing operation of one of the City's few quarry activities into the next thirty to forty years.

Sections 5, 6 and 7 of the Resource Management Act all raise relevant considerations in providing for the extension of Kiwi Point Quarry.

Section 5

Section 5 is intended to be enabling, so that people and communities can manage resources in a way or at a rate that provides for (*inter alia*) economic well being, while keeping in mind the needs of future generations, safeguarding the life-supporting capacity of air, water, soil and ecosystems, and addressing adverse effects on the environment.

Section 5(2)

Investigations previously undertaken on the future of Kiwi Point Quarry identified the need to maintain access to the strategic resource and a strong business case to retain the quarry as an operational activity within the city – thus meeting the “economic well being” aspects of section 5. As such, through the rezoning of land, allowing

additional areas of land to be quarried, it will allow for a valuable resource to be provided, ensuring that this strategic asset of the Region remains operational.

Section 5(2)(a)

The needs of future generations are not a necessary consideration where mineral resources are involved – the Act recognises that minerals are a finite resource. However, through re-zoning of land within the Kiwi Point Quarry, it will ensure that the availability of rock resource in the area, will in part help meet the reasonably foreseeable needs of at least the next generation. By extending the life of other existing regional quarries through meeting part of the region’s aggregates demands, it also helps address the needs of future generations.

Alternative supplies of rock resource in the southern part of the Wellington Region are not readily available, with limitations on alternative quarry development due to rock resource quality, and social and economic considerations related to the Region’s level of urban development. Because of the limited availability of rock resources, extending the life of this existing quarry is beneficial to the City and Region in terms of section 5 of the Act, provided that other aspects of sustainable management are met.

Section 5(2)(b)

The rezoned areas which will be enabled by the plan change form a very small part of the City’s total environment and provides a perspective on the small scale of change involved. The quarry is required to be managed in a way that safeguards the life-supporting capacity of air, water, soil and ecosystems in both the short and long term, through the Quarry Management Plan. Through the Plan Change, an area of land currently zoned Suburban Centre is to be rezoned Open Space. That area was identified as not being required for quarrying, and as such will be contained within the northern buffer zone, providing additional protection to adjoining properties to the north. Air and water quality will be managed on a daily basis through the appropriate techniques currently applied as part of the existing quarry. The soil resource and ecosystem of the site is of limited quality as the area has previously largely been quarried to bedrock and site vegetation is in relatively early stages of regeneration.

Through the plan change, the requirement for a Rehabilitation Plan will no longer be a provision of the District Plan. Instead, a chapter will be incorporated into the Quarry Management Plan which sets out the objective and principles for the rehabilitation of the site and the techniques that will be adopted in order to achieve them. One main technique to achieve the principles is for an annual implementation plan to be prepared to ensure rehabilitation is undertaken as areas of the quarry are progressively closed. Each implementation plan will be tailored to the specific area and will incorporate knowledge gained from ongoing monitoring, trialling and testing to find solutions to meet the specifics of each site. This technique will ensure maximum flexibility to respond to new situations, ensuring that the life supporting capacity of the site is restored over time, albeit to a modified form.

Section 5(2)(c)

The proposed Plan Change incorporates a range of mechanisms to avoid, remedy or mitigate any adverse effects associated with the quarry activity which it provides for. This includes the following:

- limiting the extended area of the quarry to within the identified quarry boundaries
- providing a buffer zone along the entire northern boundary of the quarry
- providing a restriction on the proposed extended hours for blasting
- stating levels on the amended Appendix 5 plan illustrating the final elevation of cleanfilling
- developing rehabilitation principles and techniques to be contained within the Quarry Management Plan for the rehabilitation of the site as the quarry is progressively closed
- complying with the Quarry Management Plan as part of the quarry operation
- undertaking a review of the Quarry Management Plan every five years
- providing a simplification of the District Plan by merging rules so that both the northern and southern quarry areas operate under one set of rules and will be identified on one map, providing clarity to Plan users.
- rezoning an area of land no longer required for quarrying purposes from Suburban Centre to Open Space.

Together, the Plan Change provisions address all relevant effects, backed by the implementation of the Quarry Management Plan.

Section 6

The proposed Plan Change does not affect any matter of national importance in this part of the Resource Management Act.

Section 7

Matters to which decision-makers must have particular regard include:

- (a) Kaitiakitanga. The concerns raised through the initial consultation with the Wellington Tenth Trust were regarding visual amenity and the stream. Both concerns have been addressed in the rehabilitation principles identified in the Quarry Management Plan, with techniques adopted to ensure any effects on visual amenity of the Ngauranga Gorge when viewed from the harbour are remedied. The stream has also been identified in the Quarry Management Plan as an area that would benefit from extensive rehabilitation.
- (b) Efficient use and development of natural and physical resources. The Plan Change allows for the use of an existing accessible natural mineral resource, and builds on a range of existing physical resources including existing quarry infrastructure. The proposal is considered to be the best of

alternatives evaluated during the investigations that have led to the preparation of this Plan Change, in terms of economic and environmental efficiency.

- (c) The maintenance and enhancement of amenity values. While the Plan Change provides for an extension to the existing quarry activity, it also requires the activity to be undertaken in a way that has minimal effect on amenity values. Although the quarry boundaries will be extended, a buffer zone will be provided along the entire northern boundary of the site. This will reduce any effects on amenity values for adjoining properties to the north. While in the short to medium term there may be some adverse visual effect, in the long term, the amenity values of the immediate area will change little as a result of the Plan Change. Any effects will be remedied through the rehabilitation principles, including the overall rehabilitation objective for the quarry which is to establish native vegetation cover that contributes to the Council's vision for Ngauranga Gorge to become part of the inner green belt.
- (d) Intrinsic value of ecosystems. The rehabilitation principles and techniques will ensure that ecological values in the long term will be improved as part of the overall open space strategy for the Ngauranga Gorge. The progressive rehabilitation of the site will enable natural processes to resume functioning, albeit to a modified form.
- (f) Maintenance and enhancement of the quality of the environment. The areas to be rezoned from Open Space B to Suburban Centre will be required to comply and adhere to the Quarry Management Plan. The maintenance and enhancement of the quality of the environment will be achieved through the provisions in the District Plan and through the Quarry Management Plan, including chapter 7 which identifies the rehabilitation principles for the quarry. Maintenance will be carried out on rehabilitated areas and commitment to ongoing monitoring will ensure that progress is noted and any remedial maintenance is undertaken to guarantee the quality of the environment is enhanced.
- (g) Any finite characteristics of natural and physical resources. The rock resource which will be made available for quarrying as a result of the proposed Plan Change is a finite resource in terms of its location and quality. The extension of the quarry boundaries and the re-zoning of land to allow for quarry activities to be undertaken makes best use of the available resource, whilst balancing visual and other impacts. Thus the rock resource can be made available for beneficial economic and social use with minimal adverse effects on the gorge landscape.

Section 8

Treaty principles have been addressed through the initial consultation process. Concerns raised by the Wellington Tenth Trust have been addressed through the development and incorporation of the rehabilitation principles and techniques within the Quarry Management Plan, which relate to concerns initially raised by the Wellington Tenth Trust.

4. Appropriateness in terms of Plan Objectives

Wellington City District Plan contains no city wide objectives of relevance to this proposed plan change. Instead, the rezoning has been evaluated for appropriateness in terms of the Resource Management Act above, and is found to be appropriate.

Chapter 6.2 of the District Plan sets the objectives and policies for the use and development of Wellington's Suburban Centre areas. As the Plan Change will involve a map change to rezone a number of areas from Open Space B to Suburban Centre, the objectives and policies in this Chapter apply. With regard to the proposed Plan Change the following objectives and policies are particularly relevant:

Objective 6.2.1 ***To promote the efficient use and development of natural and physical resources within Suburban Centre areas.***

Analysis

By incorporating the identified areas currently zoned Open Space B within the one zone, being Suburban Centre, it will promote the efficient use and development of the natural rock resource within the Kiwi Point Quarry and will enable the ongoing use of the existing physical infrastructure in the vicinity, including the quarry plant and infrastructure and the roading system.

Policy 6.2.1.1 ***Generally contain existing Suburban Centres within defined boundaries.***

Analysis

The boundaries of the Suburban Centre areas in Plan Map 22 will be adjusted slightly to enable the development of the rock resource in the areas currently zoned Open Space B, as a single integrated purpose. The map change will also define the boundary of the quarry to provide definition.

Policy 6.2.1.2 ***Encourage a wide range of activities by allowing most uses or activities within a Suburban Centre provided that the conditions specified in the Plan are satisfied.***

Analysis

Within the context of the permissive framework of this policy, the proposed Plan Change provides specifically for quarrying activities within the area specified in the plan rules. It therefore restricts the range of future activities that can be undertaken once quarrying is completed. The reason for this slight departure from the policy normally applying in the zone, is to allow future generations to determine the long-term use of the land (whether as open space, commercial, industrial or other range of uses). The Plan Change contains specific conditions for the quarry activity as a permitted activity and is in accordance with that part of the above policy.

Objective 6.2.2 ***To maintain and enhance the amenity values of Suburban Centres and nearby Residential Areas.***

Analysis

This objective and the associated policies, is achieved through specifying conditions, standards and terms in the District Plan and requiring resource consents to be obtained when activities do not meet the standards. The proposed Plan Change will be required to comply with the specific provisions for quarrying, to ensure that amenity values are generally maintained, and will in the longer term be enhanced through site rehabilitation as identified under the Quarry Management Plan, and through the preparation of an annual implementation plan, tailored to suit the specific area. Amenity values of adjoining properties will be enhanced through the extension of a buffer zone along the northern boundary. An area of quarry land currently zoned Suburban Centre and which is no longer required for quarrying purposes, will be rezoned Open Space and will form part of the buffer zone.

Objective 6.2.3 *To maintain and enhance the physical character, townscape and streetscape of Suburban Centres.*

Analysis

The existing physical character of this Suburban Centre area has been defined through the activities undertaken on the quarry site throughout the operation of the quarry. The extension of the quarry boundaries and the rezoning of a number of areas of land from Open Space B to Suburban Centre will not significantly alter the existing physical character or streetscape of the site. As such, this objective will be maintained.

Policy 6.2.3.3A *Provide for the development and site rehabilitation of Kiwi Point Quarry and ~~Kiwi Point Quarry Extension~~ to the extent specified in the Plan in a way that avoids, mitigates or remedies adverse effects.*

(Note: The above policy has been amended as part of the update to the District Plan as a result of proposed Plan Change 64).

Analysis

The rehabilitation of the whole of the Kiwi Point Quarry site is addressed through Chapter 7 of the Quarry Management Plan. Chapter 7 sets out the objective for the rehabilitation of the site and the principles and techniques that will be applied in order to achieve them.

The rehabilitation principles of the Kiwi Point Quarry site are as follows:

- 1. To revegetate the quarry in a way that supports the vision of the Inner Green Belt*
- 2. To conduct rehabilitation concurrently with quarry operations, coordinating progressive completion with rehabilitation*
- 3. To finish the quarry faces to resemble the steep bluff landforms that would have occurred naturally in the Ngauranga Gorge*
- 4. To conduct rehabilitation in a manner that encourages rapid vegetation of the slopes, reducing the duration of visual impacts.*
- 5. To promote biodiversity and rehabilitate natural processes within the site.*

As part of the rehabilitation of the site, and to ensure that rehabilitation is undertaken annually as areas of the quarry are progressively closed, it is proposed that specific rehabilitation activities will be planned and carried out on an annual basis as part of an implementation plan. Each implementation plan will be tailored to the progressive closures of the quarry, and will incorporate knowledge gained from ongoing monitoring, trialling, and testing to find solutions to meet the specifics of each site. This will ensure maximum flexibility to respond to new situations, making certain that rehabilitation is carried out in a way that remedies any adverse effects.

Summary

The proposed Plan Change does not involve any new objectives. It has been assessed above in terms of the relevant objectives and policies, and is found to be in general accordance with the framework for Suburban Centres established by the existing objectives. The proposed Plan Change is consistent with the objective that relates directly to the Kiwi Point Quarry. It is considered that the extension of the quarry boundary and the rezoning of a number of areas will ensure both the efficient utilisation of this important resource, whilst safeguarding the amenity of adjacent properties through the adoption of the rehabilitation principles.

5. Appropriateness of Policies, Rules and Other Methods

Analysis

The following table (Table 1) assesses the efficiency, effectiveness and appropriateness of the various elements of the proposed Plan Change, as follows:

- Plan Map Change – Extension of Quarry Boundaries
- Restriction of Blasting Hours
- Alteration of Buffer Zone
- Simplification of Rules 7.1.3 and 7.1.3A
- Rezoning of Land
- Adoption of the rehabilitation principles into the Quarry Management Plan

Summary

The analysis in Table 1 indicates that the consolidated and amended provisions in proposed Plan Change 64 are efficient, effective and appropriate. The plan change simplifies the District Plan in terms of merging existing rules that relate directly to the Kiwi Point Quarry, consequently addressing the quarry as a single entity.

The rezoning of areas of land within the amended quarry boundary, will enable the ongoing supply of a much needed natural resource to the city and region within a framework of rules, including the Quarry Management Plan. This framework will limit any adverse effects of the future quarrying activity through appropriate mechanisms, whilst assisting in the enhancement of the natural environment and amenity values of the Ngauranga Gorge.

6. Recommended Proposed Plan Change

It is recommended that Council notify proposed District Plan Change No. 64.

Contact Officer: Jason Jones
Planning and Resource Management Technician
Wellington City Council

Planning Consultant: Sylvia Allan
National Planning Team Leader
MWH NZ Ltd

Table 1: District Plan Changes relating to Kiwi Point Quarry and Kiwi Point Quarry Extension

	Plan Map Change – Extension of Quarry Area			
	OPTION 1: Do Nothing – retain current Plan Map boundaries.	OPTION 2: Rezone identified areas from Open Space B to Suburban Centres		
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	It is unlikely that the part of the proposed quarry that is located within the Open Space B Area could obtain resource consent.	It is unlikely that any quarrying activity would obtain resource consent within an Open Space Area unless specific rules were designed to allow for the activity. This would undermine the objectives and integrity of the Open Space B zone.		
Costs	The costs would be that resource consent for only part of the rock resource could be sought (i.e. areas within the Suburban Centre Area) with some certainty of success. The inappropriate zone boundary would result in a quarry area that was highly visible and less economic than if the whole of the area was available for quarrying.	The costs would be that the rock resource within the Buffer Zone area would not be available for beneficial use. Demand would need to be met from elsewhere with consequent downstream economic and/or environmental effects.		
Benefits	The rock resource would remain in site and the physical effects of quarrying would not occur.	The additional rock resource would be sourced locally providing an important resource to the City and Region.		
Appropriateness	This option is inappropriate and not recommended.	This option is recommended.		
	Restriction of Rock Blasting Hours			
	OPTION 1: Do Nothing – retain current restrictions on hours permitted to blast rock	OPTION 2: Change hours of blasting for rock production to between 10.00am and 2.00pm	OPTION 3: Have no restriction on hours of rock blasting	
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	This option would ensure that potential effects of noise would be controlled, therefore achieving District Plan objectives.	The proposed extension in timeframe will be consistent with the Quarry Management Plan, providing for an efficient and effective operation of the site.	This option would not control potential effects of noise on adjoining landowners due to there being no restriction on hours of rock blasting, therefore not achieving District Plan objectives.	

Costs	The blasting of rock is restricted to a small window of opportunity.	Issues of noise will be of a concern to surrounding landowners.	Issues of noise will be of concern to surrounding landowners, and there will be no certainty of when blasting will be undertaken.	
Benefits	There are no benefits in the status quo.	The benefits will allow the blasting of rock to be undertaken during a longer time period, instead of being restricted to a timeframe of 10 minutes. It is noted that the blasting of rock will still be required to comply with provisions of the District Plan requiring adjoining landowners to be notified in writing one week in advance of blasting, and also the procedures for blasting as set out in the Quarry Management Plan.	It will allow the quarry to undertake the blasting of rock at any time of the day, instead of being restricted to certain times.	
Appropriateness	This option is inappropriate and is not recommended.	This option is recommended.	This option is inappropriate and is not recommended.	
	Alteration of Northern Buffer Zone			
	OPTION 1: Do Nothing –retain as is	OPTION 2: Create a 40 metre wide buffer zone along the entire northern boundary	OPTION 3: Create a buffer zone along the entire northern boundary	OPTION 4: Have no buffer zone
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	Retaining the existing buffer zone will be effective in achieving the maintenance of amenity values to those properties on the northern boundary that adjoin the buffer zone.	The creation of a 40 metre wide buffer zone will be effective in achieving District Plan objectives, in particular maintaining and enhancing the amenity values of residential areas to the north.	By providing a buffer zone, the amenity values of adjoining landowners to the north will be maintained and enhanced, therefore achieving District Plan objectives.	This option will not maintain or enhance the amenity values of adjoining residential areas to the north, and as such will not be effective in achieving District Plan objectives.
Costs	There are no particular costs, except that properties on the northern boundary that do not adjoin the buffer zone will not be protected from activities associated with the quarry.	A reduction in areas that could be quarried, resulting in a valuable resource to both the City and Region not being available and supplied.	The existing 40 metre wide buffer zone may be reduced in width directly adjacent to those adjoining properties.	Quarrying could potentially be undertaken up to the boundaries with the adjoining properties to the north, creating potential adverse effects e.g. Noise, dust.
Benefits	There are no particular benefits with this option, except that a small portion of adjoining properties are protected through the 40 metre wide buffer zone.	Any potential effects on adjoining properties are largely avoided.	All properties adjoining the quarry on the northern boundary will be provided protection against potential effects from the quarry. Quarry operations can be undertaken in the area up to the buffer zone,	Quarrying of the important rock resource can be undertaken in an additional area.

			providing a valuable resource.	
Appropriateness	This option is not recommended.	This option not recommended.	This option is recommended.	This option is not recommended.
	Simplification of the Rules 7.1.3 & 7.1.3A			
	OPTION 1: Do nothing – retain the separate rules	OPTION 2: Merge the relevant rules	OPTION 3: Write new rules for the whole quarry area	
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	Objectives of the District Plan would continue to be achieved.	The District Plan objectives would continue to be achieved. Additionally, there will be an increase in clarity of the District Plan.	Through the writing of new rules for the whole quarry area, it may require new objectives to be produced to compliment existing objectives contained within the District Plan.	
Costs	There are no particular costs with this option.	There are no particular costs with this option.	This option will be time consuming when compared to Option 2.	
Benefits	There are no particular benefits with this option.	The benefits of this option is that the whole quarry area will be subject to one set of rules, resulting in an increase in clarity of the District Plan	The whole quarry area will be subject to one set of rules providing clarity of the District Plan.	
Appropriateness	This option is inappropriate and is not recommended.	This option is recommended.	This option is not recommended.	
	Rezoning of land			
	OPTION 1: Do nothing - require a consent for all quarry activities in those areas	OPTION 2: Rezone areas from Open Space B to Suburban Centres to allow for quarry activities as a permitted activity subject to specified conditions		
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	This approach would require the quarry to describe its operation in detail and obtain resource consent for the combined areas, or each area separately, which would be subject to conditions. A change to conditions would have to be sought, or new resource consents obtained if there was any change from the consented activity.	This approach would allow quarrying activities in those areas to operate as a permitted activity, subject to specified conditions. This option will allow for consistency with that for the existing Kiwi Point Quarry operation, and is considered to be efficient and effective in that standards to be achieved are set. Any departure from the rules will require a consent		

Costs	There is cost to the operator and the community due to the consent process, and this is repeated any time there is a change from the consented activity.	There are limited costs with this option.		
Benefits	There could be a benefit in the level of detail in the conditions that can be imposed through a resource consent.	The rezoned areas will be consistent with the rest of the Kiwi Point Quarry, and can be operated and managed from the same conditions. There is also a benefit in reduced cost through not having to go through a consent process and there is also slightly more flexibility for the quarry operator.		
Appropriateness	This option could be appropriate. However, due to the ability to manage the activity within a detailed policy and rule framework under the District Plan, this option is not recommended .	This option is appropriate, and is recommended .		
	Rehabilitation			
	OPTION 1: Do Nothing – retain existing Rehabilitation Plan	OPTION 2: Update the existing Rehabilitation Plan	OPTION 3: Develop rehabilitation principles and insert into the Quarry Management Plan	OPTION 4: Have no Rehabilitation Plan or principles
Effectiveness and efficiency in achieving District Plan objectives.	It is unlikely that the existing Rehabilitation Plan would be effective and efficient in achieving District Plan objectives as it is out of date, is relatively inflexible and unresponsive to the experience learnt from rehabilitation over time, and only applies to part of the quarry-affected area.	The Rehabilitation Plan would be updated to include the northern quarry area, and to be in accordance with District Plan objectives, and the Council’s open space policy. However, it would not be adequately flexible and there would be limited opportunities to adjust it over time/	The principles would be developed to be in accordance with District Plan objectives and the Council’s open space policy and would be in accordance with the Kiwi Point Quarry Management Plan. The rehabilitation provisions will respond over time to the changing circumstances of the site and the changing knowledge about rehabilitation.	This option will not achieve the objectives of the District Plan as the quarry will not be rehabilitated, therefore not in keeping with the Council’s open space policies.

Costs	The costs of this option is that the Rehabilitation Plan is not in line with the Quarry Management Plan and is out of date. Any works undertaken outside of what is included in the Rehabilitation Plan e.g. not using specified plants, will require a Plan Change.	The costs would be that any future works undertaken outside of what is incorporated within the updated Rehabilitation Plan would still require a further Plan Change. As the Quarry Management Plan is required to be updated every 5 years, there is the potential for the Rehabilitation Plan to become quickly out of date.	The costs would be that the principles would provide an overall guide, and would not provide specific planting plans for each area of the quarry.	The costs of not having rehabilitation principles or a Rehabilitation Plan would be on visual quality. If the quarry was not rehabilitated, the scar on the landscape would be immense. The Council's open space strategy would not be achieved.
Benefits	The benefit would be that no additional work is required at this initial stage.	The updated Rehabilitation Plan would relate to the full extent of the quarry and would be in accordance with the Quarry Management Plan and the Council's open space policy.	The development of principles and techniques would reduce the requirement for further plan changes as they would provide a basis for the rehabilitation of the site, without being too specific and restrictive. This option would allow a Rehabilitation Plan to be developed in the future if the Council deemed it necessary at a later stage.	There is little benefit in not providing guidance to the rehabilitation of the quarry site.
Appropriateness	This option is inappropriate and not recommended.	This option is inappropriate and not recommended.	This option is recommended.	This option is inappropriate and not recommended.

Appendix 1: Management of Effects

Type of Effect	Description of Effect	Means of Avoidance, remedy or Mitigation through Plan Change
Dust	Minor effects during quarry activity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must meet permitted activity standard. • Addressed in Quarry Management Plan
Water Quality	Minor effects during quarry activity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will require regional consents • Addressed in Quarry Management Plan • NB: intention is to collect and pump all site stormwater through existing quarry treatment system
Water Quantity	Potential effects in changes in surface and groundwater during quarry excavation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will require regional consents • Addressed in Quarry Management Plan
Wind	Minor localised effects due to changed topography.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mitigation not required
Noise	Minor effects from quarry activity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must meet permitted activity standards • Must meet rules for blasting • Consultation must be undertaken
Vibration	<i>De minimus</i> effect from quarry activity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must meet rules for blasting
Ecology	Minor effects due to excavation. Long term positive effects through rehabilitation of site.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quarrying restricted to areas identified in Appendix 5 through permitted activity standard • Retention of Karaka groves required through Appendix 5 • The site must be rehabilitated • Addressed through the Quarry Management Plan
Visual Impact	Short to medium term effects due to excavation and cut face prior to rehabilitation.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quarrying restricted to areas and finished levels shown in Appendix 5 through permitted activity standard. • Retention of Karaka groves and screen planting required through Appendix 5. • The identification of buffer zones as identified in Appendix 5. • Rehabilitation of the site in compliance with the rehabilitation principles contained within the Quarry Management Plan • Must meet rules relating to length of time any building may be on the site.
Traffic	<i>De minimus</i> effect of traffic	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Access to SH1 controlled through special rule.
Safety	Minor effect associated with quarry	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must meet permitted activity

	activity.	<p>standard for safety fencing and buffer zone</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Location/design of access road to minimise risks.
Cultural (tangata whenua)	<i>De minimus</i> effect	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mitigation through consultation on the plan change and the adoption of rehabilitation principles in the Quarry Management Plan.