

Proposed District Plan Change 53

Proposed Additions and Deletions to Listed Heritage Buildings, Objects and Areas

Summary of Submissions

Submission Number	Name	Address for Service	Wishes to be heard
1	Rail Heritage Trust of New Zealand	PO Box 593, Wellington	No
<p>The submission relates to the Wellington Railyards Workshop, Thorndon Quay.</p> <p>The submitter supports the inclusion of the building in the District Plan but identifies that the word “workshop” as described in the buildings description should be amended. The word “workshop” specifically relates to locomotive and rolling stock construction and in fact the Thorndon Quay building is only used for repairs and maintenance and therefore is better described as a depot.</p> <p>The submitter has provided an amended inventory to reflect this status.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>That the Thorndon Quay building be described as Railway Locomotive and Rolling Stock Depot 1937 and included in the District Plan Heritage List and the background heritage inventory amended to reflect this.</p>			
2	New Zealand Defence Force C/o- J.D. MacLachlan	Headquarters New Zealand Defence Force Private Bag, Wellington	Yes
<p>The submission relates to the former General Headquarters and HMNZS Olphert buildings, corner Taranaki/Buckle Streets and the Fort Balance Heritage Area, Fort Balance Road.</p> <p>The submitter supports the inclusion of the buildings and the creation of a heritage area in the District Plan.</p> <p>The NZDF notes that the buildings are located within a designated Defence Purposes Site and as such, the designation has primacy. Further, the buildings have also been identified for strengthening or demolition under s66 of the Building Act and NZDF are considering options regarding this.</p> <p>The NZDF notes that the object list and map for the Fort balance Heritage Area should include Fort Gordon, the Seesaw Searchlight emplacement, 12 pounder/4 inch Battery, Lower battery and magazine, Submarine Mining test Room and Observation Post.</p> <p>The NZDF suggests that the Kau Point Battery Site of 1890 should also be considered for future listing.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>That the former General Headquarters and HMNZS Olphert buildings, corner Taranaki/Buckle Streets and the Fort Balance Heritage Area, Fort Balance Road (with suggested additions) be included in the District Plan Heritage List.</p>			
3	Wellington Civic Trust C/o- G.A. Town	PO Box 19173, Wellington	No
<p>The Trust strongly supports the proposed Plan Change but would also like to see the list extended further.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>Endorse and approve proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			

4	Friends of Wellington's Botanic Gardens C/o – Edward Woodfield	1/67 Bolton Street, Wellington	No
<p>The submission relates to the Botanic Garden Buildings</p> <p>Friends of Wellington's Botanic Gardens fully support the addition of the buildings in the District Plan.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>Approve proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			
5	Ian Woodmore	17 Richmond Hill, Glenside, Wellington	No
<p>The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.</p> <p>The submitter supports the proposed Plan Change but would also like to see the list extended further to include other items within the Glenside area, particularly along Middleton Road (the old Porirua Road trail). Consideration should also be given to making Glenside a Heritage Area.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>Approve proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			
6	New Zealand Historic Places Trust C/o – Ann Neill	Central Region Office Level 1, Tadix House, 1 Blair Street, PO Box 19173, Wellington	Yes
<p>The Trust supports the proposed additions to the District Plan Heritage List, particularly those which are also noted on the Historic Places Trust Register.</p> <p>The Trust does raise concern as to the extent to which the building's setting and surroundings are listed and encourages the Council to be more precise in this regard. In addition, further information should be provided as to why places are proposed and include an aerial photograph showing the boundaries of a site.</p> <p>The proposed map for Fort Balance is unclear and should also identify the former tram line and magazine buildings.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>The NZHPT recommends that Council adopt proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			
7	Dean, Wardens and Vestry of Wellington Cathedral of St Paul	Cnr Molesworth and Hill Street, Wellington	Yes
<p>The submission relates to St Paul Wellington Cathedral, the Lady Chapel and Service Buildings.</p> <p>The submitter opposes the inclusion of the buildings on the District Plan Heritage List.</p> <p>The buildings were created for, and are dedicated for the purposes of divine worship and its associated liturgical activities that derives for Church doctrine and is subject to change from time to time. The building is subject to the Diocesan Properties and Facilities Act which means before any internal alterations may be undertaken, a faculty is required (diocesan approval for any change). In addition, those responsible for management and any developments have strict lines of accountability to parishioners, the Diocese and the Bishop. The proposed listing would constitute an unwarranted intrusion on the stewardship exercised by the Wardens and Vestry in relation to the property.</p> <p>The function of the Cathedral is not a static one and should respond to changing social or community needs. Over time, liturgical developments mean that the interior layout, furnishings and other aspects will need to be changed. In addition, the site and the buildings are not in their complete form and the whole complex is in an important sense 'work in progress'. The proposed listing would unduly restrict the function of the Cathedral.</p> <p>The submitters would be pleased to explore with the Council ways to acknowledge the significance of the Cathedral without imposing unnecessary restrictions on the future management of the place.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>Remove Wellington Cathedral of St Paul, the Lady Chapel and Service Buildings from proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			
8	Claire Bibby	1 Winchester Drive East, Glenside,	No

Wellington			
<p>The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.</p> <p>The submitter supports the proposed Plan Change and notes the significance that the Halfway House represents and that the Nott House should eventually be restored</p> <p>Decision Requested: Approve proposed District Plan Change 53.</p>			
9	Onslow Historical Society Inc C/o – Murray Pillar, President	86 Khandallah Road, Khandallah, Wellington	No
<p>The submission relates to the former custodians house 86 Clare Street, former Kaiwharawhara School 7 Fore Street, the Community Hall 550 Ohariu Valley Road, the former Levin and Co Warehouse School Road, the Halfway House 246 Middleton Road and Nott House 400 Middleton Road.</p> <p>The Society supports the inclusion of these buildings on the District Plan Heritage List.</p> <p>Decision Requested: That the above mentioned buildings be added to District Plan Heritage List.</p>			
10	Glenside Progressive Association C/o – Claire Bibby	1 Winchester Drive East, Glenside, Wellington	Yes
<p>The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.</p> <p>The Association supports the proposed Plan Change and notes the significance of this cluster of buildings along Middleton Road, including Greer House also known as Clarence Farm 420 Middleton Road and 300 Middleton Road now 1 Winchester Drive East.</p> <p>The proposed listings are consistent with the desires of the Glenside residents, the Halfway House Conservation Plan 2004 and the Glenside Reserve Future Options report.</p> <p>The Association has provided additional supporting information on the Halfway House.</p> <p>Decision Requested: Approve proposed District Plan Change 53, particularly the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.</p>			
11	The Architectural Centre Inc. C/o – Christine McCarthy, President	PO Box 24178, Wellington	Yes
<p>The submitter conditionally supports the proposed Plan Change but would also like to see the list extended further.</p> <p>The submitter recommends that the Council:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adopt a system that enables more frequent inclusion of new items onto the District Plan Heritage List. • Provide greater clarification for sites with multiple addresses • Provide a more effective protection system for heritage items, including financial penalties if heritage values are compromised • Notate explicitly interiors, fixtures and fittings in all cases • Discourage facadism and that the minimum heritage listing cover 'façade and building structure' • Give greater recognition to modernism/Post-World war II buildings as acknowledged in the WCC Built Heritage Policy (2005) • The unpainted state of a building should be explicitly recognized when it is an integral part of a building • Give greater recognition of site-specific sculpture 			

- Provide maps and protect important urban spaces to preserve this aspect of the special character of Te Aro
- Give greater recognition to exemplar heritage and development in the city
- Establish a 'negative heritage list' to provide incentives and positive design to encourage redevelopment.

The submitter has provided suggested lists, including further additions to the heritage list, negatives examples of heritage, alterations to the heritage list and deletions from the heritage list.

Decision Requested:

Approve proposed District Plan Change 53 but also consider other key issues and buildings outlined in this submission.

12	Lawson Robertson	5 Pauline Way, Paparangi, Wellington	Yes
----	------------------	--------------------------------------	-----

The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road. The submitter **opposes** the inclusion of these buildings on the District Plan Heritage list and questions the accuracy of the information provided about these properties. A thorough heritage review of all North Wellington should be undertaken in the first instance to avoid overburdening people in inaccurate information.

Decision Requested:

Remove Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road from the proposed District Plan Heritage List.

13	Docomomo New Zealand C/o – Dr Julia Gatley	C/o School of Architecture and Planning, The University of Auckland Private Bag 92019, Auckland	No
----	---	--	----

The organisation **supports** the proposed Plan Change in principle but would also like to see the list extended further to greater recognise modern buildings, sites and neighbourhoods.

The submitter notes that unpainted off-form concrete is important to modernist buildings and should be protected. Further, facadism is not supported as this approach denies the significance of buildings, places and interiors.

The submitter has provided Wellington examples for future consideration from the organisation's national network which lists New Zealand's best and most important modern buildings, sites and neighbourhoods dating from 1904 to 1984.

Decision Requested:

Approve proposed District Plan Change 53 but also consider other buildings outlined in this submission.

14	Baptist Union of New Zealand C/o – Andrew Beatson, Barrister	Harbour Chambers, 10 Floor, Equinox House, 111 The Terrace PO Box 10242, Wellington	Yes
----	---	--	-----

This submission relates the Former Primitive Methodist Church and Manse, 22 Donald McLean Street

The submitter **opposes** the inclusion of the buildings on the District Plan Heritage List and particularly notes that:

- The buildings do not have such social, technical or architectural value that warrant listing in the District Plan
- The buildings are not recognised by the NZHPT Register
- The proposed listing could place the long term plans and economic well being of the church in jeopardy
- The current maintenance and upkeep of the buildings is not a sustainable use of church funds
- The church needs upgrading
- The existing configuration of the building does not meet the social or spiritual needs of the local Chinese community members.

<p>The proposed listing is contrary to Part 2, Section 5 of the Resource Management Act 1991 in that it fails to enable the Wellington Chinese Baptist Church community to provide for its social, economic and cultural wellbeing in an appropriate manner.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>That the Former Primitive Methodist Church at 22 Donald McLean Street not be listed in the District Plan as a Heritage Building.</p>			
15	The Thorndon Society C/o – Tony Burton	PO Box 12398, Wellington	Yes
<p>This submission relates to the Cook Islands High Commission building, 56 Mulgrave Street.</p> <p>The submitter supports the inclusion of the building on the District Plan Heritage List.</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>Approve proposed District Plan Change 53, in particular 56 Mulgrave Street.</p>			
16	The Shepherd Trust C/o – Gibson Sheat Lawyers	Gibson Sheat Centre, Level 3, 1 Margaret Street, Private Bag 31905 Lower Hutt	Yes
<p>This submission relates to the Shepherds Arms, 285 Tinakori Road</p> <p>The submitter opposes the inclusion of the building on the District Plan Heritage List on the following grounds:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The building has little, if any, heritage value due to past alterations to the building fabric. This as involved external re-cladding, removal of internal walls and flooring, installation of a new staircase and electrical and sewage upgrading. • The addition of the building to the Heritage List will have a detrimental impact on the value of the building as a commercial investment • The listing would unnecessarily impact on private property rights. <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>That the District Plan Change 53 be amended by the removal of the building at 258 Tinakori Road, Thorndon, Wellington from the list of proposed additions to the Heritage Listings.</p>			
17	Wesley Wellington Parish C/o – Ian Leary	Spencer Holmes Limited Level 6, 8 Willis Street, PO Box 588, Wellington	Yes
<p>This submission relates to the Wesley Church Hall, 75 Taranaki Street.</p> <p>The submitter opposes the inclusion of the building on the District Plan Heritage List.</p> <p>The building is subject to a proposed Heritage Area in Plan Change 48 (Central Area Review). The rules of proposed Plan Change 43 (Heritage Provisions). This additional listing is too onerous and unnecessary leaving the church with virtually no autonomy in the way it can administer and use its land for the benefit of its parishioners.</p> <p>The site already contains a listed church and two heritage trees. There is significant cost to maintaining the heritage aspects of the site which is for the spiritual benefit of parishioners. Such maintenance is not for the benefit of the Council and the wider community.</p> <p>The proposed listing will limit changes that will unquestionably be needed in the near future to meet the Parishes requirements. The proposed restrictions may jeopardize the church's commitment to the site and represent an unreasonable ongoing burden on the Parish community</p> <p>Decision Requested:</p> <p>That the Wesley Church Hall be deleted from the Heritage List of Buildings proposed under District Plan Change 53.</p>			
18	Barry Blackett	26 Glenside Road, Wellington	No
<p>The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.</p> <p>The submitter strongly supports the proposed Plan Change and notes the significance that the Halfway</p>			

House represents and that both houses could readily be restored in the future.			
Decision Requested:			
Approve proposed District Plan Change 53, particularly the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road and Nott House, 400 Middleton Road.			
19	Sandra Moran	Oakley Moran, Barristers and Solicitors 1 st Floor Leaders Building, 15 Brandon Street, Wellington	Yes
The submission relates to 234 and 240 Oriental Parade, Wellington			
The submitter opposes the inclusion of the buildings on the District Plan Heritage List on the following grounds:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed plan change appears to 'single out' these dwelling houses when there are other examples in the area which do not appear to be listed • There is no longer heritage value in the remaining properties along Oriental Parade as Council has allowed more recent high rise developments to change the landscape for ever • The heritage classification will not allow the owners to develop their sections in a similar manner to neighbouring properties. • Heritage areas are more aligned to areas such as Thorndon • Owners should not be penalised for significant rates as a result unrestricted development of high rise buildings as well as being prevented from developing their sections 			
Decision Requested:			
That 234 and 240 Oriental Parade be removed from proposed District Plan Change 53.			
20	Dr Peter Russell and Mrs Renee Russell	18 Genside Road, Wellington	No
The submission relates to the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road			
The submitter supports the proposed Plan Change and notes the historical, architectural, uniqueness and potential that the building represents.			
Decision Requested:			
Approve proposed District Plan Change 53, particularly the Halfway House, 246 Middleton Road.			
21	Francis and Sandra Lepper	22 Cleveland Street, Brooklyn Wellington	No
The submission relates to the former Brooklyn Post and Telegraph Office Building, 22 Cleveland Street, Brooklyn			
The submitter supports the inclusion of the main building in the District Plan but state that 1950's garage and shed be excluded from the proposed listing. These out buildings have no historical significance and should be removed from the proposed listing.			
The submitter suggests that the Council should consider the manufacture of, and installation of an appropriate plaque denoting that the building has been recognised for its historic value.			
Decision Requested:			
That the former Brooklyn Post and Telegraph Office Building, 22 Cleveland Street, Brooklyn be included in the District Plan Heritage List but the description be amended to exclude the 1950's garage and shed.			