

BEFORE THE INDEPENDENT HEARINGS PANEL AT WELLINGTON CITY

UNDER THE Resource Management Act 1991

IN THE MATTER OF the hearing of submissions on the Wellington City Proposed District Plan
(Hearing Stream 3)

Submission of Mt Victoria Historical Society Inc

Submissions 214, FS39

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Mt Victoria is unique in Wellington for its high concentration of Victorian and Edwardian wooden dwellings. It is important for its accessibility and visibility, and for the cultural, social and economic stories it tells about the development of Wellington.

It is constantly used in imagery to promote Wellington and has become an iconic view of the city, nationally and internationally recognised, and used in publications from French traveller publication 'Guide Voir', to Air New Zealand magazines, to national newspapers.

- 1.2 Mt Victoria is one of the oldest suburbs in Aotearoa, laid out in Mein Smith's 1840 plan for the city. Its 'character' derives in particular from the heritage of its Victorian and Edwardian housing stock. 85% properties pre-date 1930, 90% of these categorised as primary and contributory¹ (38% and 52% respectively). It has a number of houses built in 1869 – some of the earliest extant dwellings in the city.

But more than buildings representing the architecture of a certain period, these are 'living' reminders of the people who have built our city: labourers, small and prosperous businessmen, temperance leaders, educators and brilliant men and women, workers for their churches and social causes. Many of these layers of history behind the façade of a house are already known: many more are yet to be told. It can be visualised and understood by walking through Mt Victoria.

Once this heritage is gone, it is gone forever. It is not simply a subjective 'character' represented by, say, a gable-shaped roofline or dwellings in line with others on the street.

- 1.3 We support the Heritage Areas in Mount Victoria that the Council has designated in the Proposed District Plan.

We believe, however, that they should be extended.

¹ Boffa Miskell Pre-1930 Character-Area Review 23 January 2019

2. Heritage v. Character

2.1 As already outlined in Stream 2, we have issues with the definitions relating to 'character' and heritage.

2.2 We believe that Council acknowledges the historic heritage nature of Character Precincts when it says:

"their purpose is to recognise concentrations of consistent character, as informed by the Pre-1930 Character Area Review." [our underlining]

The stated methodology employed by Boffa Miskell in undertaking the Pre-1930 Character Area Review involved profiling "the age (commencing pre-1880 followed by every subsequent decade to 1930)" of buildings and preparing "an overview of the styles of domestic architecture in each character area covering the period pre-1880 to 1930" [page 2]. The Review was therefore based explicitly on the history of the houses.

By saying that 'character' is "informed by the Pre-1930 Character Area Review" - a survey based on the history of houses - the Council explicitly acknowledges that 'character' is based on historic values.

2.3 As we stated in Stream 2, it is also important not to put too much weight on the "consistent" criteria of the PDP definition of character. One of the important characteristics of the heritage of Mt Victoria is that historic patterns were often very inconsistent, with two-storey houses originally built cheek by jowl with small cottages and still standing as such.

This position is supported by the expert evidence to this Stream of Victoria Cassin for Kainga Ora. In 4.7 she states:

It is important to note that historic heritage areas can include sites that make no contribution to historic heritage but that could be improved in the future. Similarly, sites of differing qualities can make equivalent contributions to the identify of a place and its heritage values.

2.3 In his submission in Stream 2, Dean Raymond of Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga (NZPT) stated:

26. The criteria for identifying historic heritage is broader than the physical and architectural values of the Character Precincts. The definition of historic heritage and the criteria contained in Policy 21 of the Regional Policy Statement outline the range of qualities and values which need to be considered when assessing whether a place or area is formally identified as 'historic heritage'. I also note that the PDP includes several residential historic areas, some of which overlap with the identified Character Precincts.

27. Dr Jacobs makes some interesting comments on this topic, drawing from his experience of working within a jurisdiction which does not differentiate in the same way between character and heritage – where they are viewed as intimately related two sides of the same coin. In particular I take note of his comment that if the added historical layers of people, events, and social movements were to be taken into account, the areas recognised as character could equally be seen as heritage. [Our underlining]

It is our contention that, given the documented layers of people and events associated with many houses in Mt Victoria, they should be considered for

heritage listing or as part of Heritage Areas. Note, for example, the history of Stafford Street, which is currently not even designated as Character Precinct:

<https://mtvictoria.history.org.nz/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/01-Stafford-Street-Story.pdf>

For many houses which do not have a documented social history researched by WCC consultants or Mount Victoria Historical Society, it is simply a question of lack of resource.

- 2.4 Dating back to its submission on the Draft Spatial Plan in October 2020, Mount Victoria Historical Society has called for the former pre-1930 demolition area to be considered a heritage area. It therefore agrees with other submitters (e.g. David Lee, submitter 454) that Character Precincts should be designated Heritage Areas. The character only derives from the heritage.

This position is supported by the expert evidence of Veronica Cassin for Kainga Ora to this Hearing Stream, in her recommendation that the Mount Victoria North Townscape should be recognised as a Heritage Area. If this is the case for that part of Mt Victoria – most of which is also designated a Character Precinct – it is also true for other Character Precinct areas of the suburb.

3. Mount Victoria North Townscape

- 3.1 For the reasons set out in 2 above, we support the view of Veronica Cassin in her expert evidence for Kainga Ora to this Hearing Stream.
- 3.2 We agree that the historic heritage values of this area indicate that it should be designated a Heritage Area.

4. Tutchen Avenue/Porritt Avenue Heritage Area

- 4.1 In item 1186 and 1187 of the S42A report, the following is stated:

1186. . . . She concludes that Tutchen Avenue shares the same history as Porritt Avenue, and the boundaries of the heritage area could be moved to include the properties along the street (subject to research and assessment). She does not recommend that the street be added as a Heritage Area at this stage. I agree with her assessment.

1187. I note procedural concerns that properties be added to the schedule without those owners having the opportunity to make a submission or speak to the hearings panel regarding this. Despite this, the properties can be added to the Council's Heritage Team's database of nominations for detailed heritage evaluations. [Our underlining]

It is clear from the above two points that Tutchen Avenue should be added to the Porritt Avenue Heritage Area. We therefore ask the Council to commit to adding this to the database of nominations for detailed evaluation and, furthermore, to commit to a timeframe for undertaking the evaluation.

- 4.2 We support the Council's decision that 115 Brougham Street b included in SCHED3– Item 45 - Porritt Avenue Heritage Area as a contributing building. [1188. HS3-Rec284]

5. New Claremont Grove Heritage Area

- 5.1 In item 1236 and 1237 of the S42A report, almost exactly the same statements are made in relation to Claremont Grove as were made about Tutchen Avenue.

It is clear that Council officers believe there is a strong case to designate Claremont Grove as a Heritage Area. We therefore ask the Council to commit to adding this to the database of nominations for detailed evaluation and, furthermore, to commit to a timeframe for undertaking the evaluation.

- 5.2 In relation to Claremont Grove, we support the inclusion of 20 Austin Street on the SCHED1 list of heritage buildings.²

It is important, however, that for reasons of historic heritage context, Claremont Grove be designated a Heritage Area. Under the revised Character Precinct boundaries in the Proposed District Plan, key houses in Claremont Grove are even left out of the Character Precinct.

6. Elizabeth Street Heritage Area

- 6.1 The Council proposes removing Nos. 50, 52, 61 and 63 Elizabeth Street from the Elizabeth Street Heritage area (Note: "No specific reason given.") [S. 42A report, items 1165-67]

In her assessment, Ms Smith's opinion is given as:

"the four properties do not include items that are fundamental to the history, physical, or social values of the heritage area."

We do not entirely agree with this assessment (50 Elizabeth Street, for example, contains stables which very quick research shows are documented in the Council's Archives as belonging to Brooks in 1911), however we would accept this change on the condition that:

- a) the proposed revised Character Precinct boundaries are approved in the Final Plan
- b) heights adjacent to the Heritage Area are restricted to 11m or less.

7. Legal precedent

- 7.1 The Basin Bridge Inquiry and the following High Court Appeal case concluded that the southern end of Mt Victoria – essentially Ellice and Paterson Streets - is a significant part of the historic heritage of Wellington.

The High Court Decision³ concluded that the Board of Inquiry did not err in recognising:

² We are concerned at the interpretation of our Further Submission on this matter in the S42A report as a simple "opposed" (711. Philip Cooke [465.4 and 465.5 (opposed by Mt Victoria Historical Society Inc FS39.10 and FS39.11)] seeks that Item 471 (20 Austin Street) is only included in SCHED1 if the surrounding buildings are included within the Character Precinct Boundary or that it is removed from SCHED1.) In fact, we were clear that we believed Claremont Grove should be designated a Heritage Area.

³ IN THE HIGH COURT OF NEW ZEALAND WELLINGTON REGISTRY, CIV 2014-485-11253 [2015] NZHC 1991, July 2015

a "wider heritage area" [of the Basin Reserve] which it considered could be affected by the Project, which stretched from Taranaki Street in the west through the Basin Reserve and Council Reserve areas to Government House and the Town Belt in the east [para 339]

and that:

The cumulative adverse effects of dominance and severance caused by the proposed transportation structure and associated mitigation structure in this sensitive heritage precinct, particularly on the northern and northeastern sectors of the Basin Reserve Historic Area setting." [para 340]

- 7.2 The above provides a clear precedent for designating southern Mt Victoria an area of historic heritage, which would therefore be a qualifying matter exempting it from the requirement under the NPS-UD to allow buildings of six or more storeys in height.

Furthermore, if this status is recognised for southern Mt Victoria under the RMA, then it would equally apply to most of the suburb.

8. Transition zone

- 8.1 As we requested in our Stream 2 submission in relation to Character Precincts, there should be a 'buffer' or transition zone between a Heritage Area and areas of 6 or more storeys in order to protect the values of houses in Heritage Areas. Allowing 21m or 28.5m buildings up against Heritage Areas will destroy the heritage or character from a visual point of view and is also likely to ultimately lead to the degradation and abandonment of such properties.
- 8.2 We ask that a 'transition zone' of three-storey buildings (11m) at least one property wide, be required between any Heritage Area and a High Density Residential Zone or City Centre Zone.

9. Heritage buildings

- 9.1 It is very disappointing that the Council has not considered adding to the heritage list in SCHED1 any of the properties we recommended.

We believe most have far more merit than, for example, 62 Majoribanks Street (built 1934/35 and no more information on the Council website) or 64 Majoribanks Street (built 1928 and included as one of a reasonably random selection in the Mount Victoria Heritage Study 2017).

Take, by contrast, the great significance of 7 Paterson Street (William Waring Taylor's house), just one of the buildings we have proposed for listing and details about which can be found in the Appendix to this submission

This highlights, once again, the inconsistent nature of Council's designations.

- 9.2 The Council in item 924 noted:

"procedural concerns that properties be added to the schedule without those owners having the opportunity to make a submission or speak to the hearings panel regarding this."

Given that the majority of the buildings on our list were proposed in our

submission to the Draft District Plan dated 13.12.2021, the Council has had a reasonable amount of time to engage in consultation with the owners.

It goes on to say:

“Despite this, the properties can be added to the Council’s Heritage Team’s database of nominations for detailed heritage evaluations.”

We therefore ask the Council to commit to adding these to the database of nominations for detailed evaluation and, furthermore, to commit to a timeframe for undertaking the evaluation and consultation.

9.3 The Council itself proposed 2 properties be listed in the District Plan which it has since removed.

One of these, 53 Ellice Street, we believe has a strong case for remaining on the list so we request that it be re-instated. In the Council’s own evaluation:

“Due to its unique design and elevated site, the house has **significant rarity value** and contributes to the **townscape** setting of Ellice Street. The house also retains a high level of **integrity**

(As 67 Austin Street is now included in a Character Precinct and was considered “a good representative example of a New Zealand timber Queen Anne Style house and has streetscape value due to its prominent corner site”, we accept its removal from the Proposed District Plan.)

9.4 Our revised list of properties recommended to be added to the list is as follows:

Address	Summary of heritage significance
13 Austin Street	Home of Charles Bayertz – major literary figure Built by Samuel Atkins - whose home now in Paterson St, Ettrick Cottage, is listed in SCHED1
17 Brougham Street	Owd Trafford - very high Art Deco design qualities, unspoiled by modern add-ons
33 Brougham Street	Hutchinson’s house/Women’s House – very early Mt Victoria house, built in 1875, and a long history of association with women’s welfare
123-125 Brougham St	Ionian Flats – very high Art Deco design qualities, unspoiled by modern add-ons
136/138 Brougham St	Rev Moir’s wife’s semi-detached houses – next door to Rev Moir’s original house in the Moir Street Heritage Area and in original condition on the exterior
9 Hawker Street	Hamilton Flats - designed by Edward Anson, one of NZ’s foremost Art Deco architects, designer of the New Zealand Centennial Exhibition held in Wellington
43 Hawker Street	Bernard Freyberg’s house - decorated soldier and Governor-General lived here in his childhood-teenage years
71 Hawker Street	John Paterson’s house Paterson and his partner built the Town Hall; he is the grandfather of artist Reuben Paterson.
7 Paterson Street	William Waring Taylor’s house See history and assessment in APPENDIX
58 Pirie Street	George Winder’s house Councillor and businessman, built a house 1884, lived here 1884-1930
49 Porritt Avenue	Kate Edger’s house First woman in New Zealand to gain a university degree and the first in the British Empire to earn a Bachelor of Arts.
23 Stafford Street	Wellington Harbour Pilot Holmes’s house Pilot (to 1888), and possibly the first Pakeha born in Wellington (25 March 1840)
1 Tutchen Avenue	Wellington Harbour Pilot Shilling’s house

	Third Pilot (1889-1913) then Deputy Harbourmaster
53 Ellice Street	In the Council's own evaluation: " <i>Due to its unique design and elevated site, the house has significant rarity value and contributes to the townscape setting of Ellice Street. The house also retains a high level of integrity. The house has some historical significance for its association associated its first owner, early 20th century bridge and wharf builder Thomas Dillon.</i> "

10. Heritage structures

10.1 It is disappointing that the Council has chosen not to add Mount Victoria tunnel to SCHED3.

We find their reasoning interesting:

1022. Ms Smith's assessment is that at present there is not enough information to determine whether the tunnel meets the criteria for listing in the district plan. She also notes that it is not listed by HNZPT, as opposed to all the other tunnels presently included on the schedule.

There is so much information available about the Mount Victoria tunnel that to say there is not enough to determine whether it meets the criteria for listing is curious. Also, the justification that it is not listed by HNZPT does not hold water as many other structures are also not listed by HNZPT and it is only the District Plan which actually provides protection.

11. Demolition by neglect

11.1 In Stream 2, we raised the issue of demolition by neglect and our concern about this practice.

We therefore support the recommendation by Dr Jacobs in expert evidence for HNZPT to this Stream (and, indirectly, of Mr McCutcheon) for the policy to be amended in an endeavour to reduce instances of this.

7 Paterson Street, Mount Victoria, Wellington

The house at 7 Paterson Street is located on Wellington Town Acre 673 and built for the prominent Wellington merchant William Waring Taylor in 1869. The building was the only structure on that Town Acre for over 30 years and became a significant landmark on the southern end of Mount Victoria.

William Waring Taylor (owner 1868-1879)

William Waring Taylor (after whom Waring Taylor Street is named) was born around 1819 in Yorkshire and arrived in Wellington in 1842. He established a general business and importing agency and dealt in land, wool, cattle, clothing, “and piece goods and commodities of every kind.” Even leeches appear now and then in his advertisements. In 1848 he married Mary Knox, aged 21. He bought Customhouse Wharf in 1860. He had estates in the Rangitikei districts as well as property in Wellington.

In 1868 Waring Taylor bought Town Acres 672 and 673 in Mt Victoria, although he had been occupying them since at least 1863 (possibly horses because the land was fenced). In January 1869, tenders were invited for construction of a Villa for W. Waring Taylor, designed by Nicholas Marchant, architect.⁴ The house was built on Town Acre 673 and valued at £750 in 1869. At this time Paterson Street had not been formed and access to the house was from Brougham Street, which was the address for the house until the formation of Paterson Street in the early twentieth century.

Architectural historian Terence Hodgson described Taylor’s house as a fine example of “fancy colonial” style, “The verandahs have been given a juicy assortment of decoration including brackets, lattice work, pierced balustrading and bold expanses of glazing” although the walls were sheathed with corrugated iron.⁵

In 1878, the City Council discussed the issue of Waring Taylor building on the Te Aro foreshore on land which he did not own.⁶ On November 21 1884 Waring Taylor was arrested for fraud at his home, Carnarvon, near Bulls⁷. The charge was that he “converted to his own use 25 fully paid-up shares in the Bank of New Zealand (£250 worth), the property of Ernest Arundel”. In fact there were three charges against him, “the total amount of monies alleged to have been misappropriated being about £10,000”, which were to be laid a few days later.⁸ The most serious charge related to fraudulently appropriating money as a trustee or agent and the others for wrongfully endeavouring to obtain a loan from a loan company and obtaining money by falsely representing the discovery of a goldfield.

When he came up for sentencing the Evening Post reported: “During his incarceration in the Terrace Gaol Taylor has grown much stouter, and his whiskers and moustache have become much longer. As he advanced to the prisoner’s stand it was seen that he was trembling in every limb and wearing a very anxious look.” He was described as being in his 66th year and as having spent 43 years in the city. He was tried, convicted on only one indictment and sentenced to 5 years jail.⁹

Waring Taylor’s sister was Mary Taylor. Mary was born in 1817 in Yorkshire and, while attending school in 1831, became a close friend of Charlotte Bronte. Mary’s life took a dramatic turn in 1840 when her father died and the family household was broken up. By 1841 her unorthodoxy became apparent when she declared that she proposed to emigrate to New Zealand with her youngest brother, Waring. The family were confused by this decision, but Charlotte Bronte clearly understood Mary better. She wrote to her sister, Emily:

⁴ Evening Post 15 January 1869, p.3 (Papers Past)

⁵ Terence Hodgson, *Proud Possessions*, p.11. A photograph of the building dating from c.1900 is published on this page.

⁶ Evening Post 30 November 1878, p.2 (Papers Past)

⁷ Evening Post 21 November 1884, p. 2 (Papers Past)

⁸ Evening Post 22 November 1884, p. 3 (Papers Past)

⁹ Evening Post 7 July 1885, p.2 (Papers Past)

“Mary Taylor and Waring have come to a singular determination, but I think under the peculiar circumstances a defensible one, though it sounds outrageously odd at first. They are going to emigrate – to quit the country altogether. Their destination unless they change is Port Nicholson, in the northern island of New Zealand!!! Mary has made up her mind she can not and will not be a governess, a teacher, a milliner, a bonnet maker nor a housemaid. She sees no means of obtaining employment she would like in England, so she is leaving it!”

Mary delayed her voyage to New Zealand a few years, arriving on July 24, 1845 aboard the *Louisa Campbell*. Waring Taylor helped his sister Mary and her cousin set up their shop, including teaching them bookkeeping.¹⁰

Mary continued her correspondence with Charlotte Bronte and after 1848 it increases markedly, prompted by her receipt of a first-edition copy of *Jane Eyre* from Charlotte. After receiving the book, Mary wrote to Charlotte:

“About a month since, I have received and read *Jane Eyre*. It seems to me incredible that you had actually written a book. Your novel surprised me as being so perfect as a work of art . . . Such events did not happen when I was in England. After I had read it, I went on to the top of Mt Victoria and looked for a ship to carry a letter to you. There was a little thing with one mast, and also *H.M.S. Fly* and nothing else. If a cattle vessel came from Sydney she would take the mail, but we have had East wind for a month and nothing can come in.”

Houston Francis Logan (owner 1879-1885) (b c.1838- d.1922)

Taylor owned the two town acres until their conveyance to Houston Frances Logan in 1878.¹¹ Measured by property, Houston Francis Logan is estimated to have been among the top ten richest people in Wellington in 1882.¹² He was by far the wealthiest person to live in Mt Victoria in the 1880's. Most wealthy people at that time, and for quite some time after, lived in Thorndon. Logan had inherited property from his father, had two grocery shops, a number of rental properties in his own right and rural properties running two flocks of sheep.

Houston was the son of Dr Francis Logan, who had visited New Zealand as a surgeon in the Royal Navy in 1837. He returned to Glasgow but immigrated to Wellington in 1840 on the *Bengal Merchant* with his wife and the infant, Houston.

Houston Logan ran grocery businesses in Lambton Quay and Cuba St from 1866 until 1884. In 1868 he was gazetted a Captain in the New Zealand Militia and was still on the Unattached List (made up of those who had served their country and “retired on their laurels”, but who could be called on to assist in the event that there were insufficient officers on the active list available for an emergency) in 1897.¹³ He also represented the Te Aro Ward on the City Council from September 1877 to September 1893. Logan owned Town Acres 672 and 673 as well as other Mt Victoria properties. He lived in the large house on Town Act 673. Then he returned to Mt Victoria in the late 1890's to live the last 25 or so years of his life in a house where No 72 Brougham St (Embassy Court Flats) now stands.

Frances Grant (owner 1885-1901)

In October 1885 a certificate of title was issued to Frances Grant for part of Town Acre 673 and part of Town Acre 672. The title notes that the land was owned by William Waring Taylor in 1879.¹⁴ A historic photograph dating from the 1890s shows the house elevated and surrounded by established trees. The

¹⁰ Joan Stevens, *Mary Taylor: friend of Charlotte Bronte, Letters from New Zealand and elsewhere*

¹¹ Deeds Index, Wellington Town Acre 673, Wellington Land District Office. Jeremy Lowe, researcher, Thorndon Historical Society, states: “Logan owned substantial property on Town Acres 672 and 673 in Mt Victoria from 1879-85, as well as other Mt Victoria properties. He lived in the large house on Town Acre 673 (then Brougham St, now on Paterson St) from 1879 to 1885.”

¹² Information from Jeremy Lowe, researcher, Thorndon Historical Society.

¹³ *Cyclopedia of New Zealand, Wellington Province, 1897* (Electronic Text Centre).

¹⁴ CT WN40/53.

building looks to be in its original form and notation on the bottom of the photograph calls it 'Laureston' with the name M.L. Grant.¹⁵ An advertisement in the *Evening Post* wanting a general servant for a small family appears in 1891. Applications are to a 'Mrs Grant, Laureston, Brougham Street'.¹⁶ The Thomas Ward survey plan of 1891 shows the house alone on Town Acre 673. It records the house as two storeys with 15 rooms and a verandah surrounding the north and west sides.¹⁷ In 1901 the land was transferred from Frances Grant to Harry Crump of Wellington, Builder.¹⁸



Harry Crump (owner 1901-1909)

Harry Crump was born in Yorkshire and spent some of his early life in America. He served his apprenticeship as a builder when he returned to Yorkshire and came to New Zealand in 1880. "He has been developing important leaseholds round Wellington, and has acquired a considerable area of land not far from Government House where he has created a suburb during the past five years [c. 1892-97], named Clermont."¹⁹

In addition to his own building projects, Harry Crump was engaged in the construction of estates and buildings with the partnership of John Thomas Hawthorn and Colin Campbell Crump. Hawthorn and Crump were responsible for developments in various areas of the city. One example of the trio's work is Kensington Street, which was developed between 1903 & 1904, under the name of the Kensington Estate Company. The Company is recorded as consisting of Hawthorn & Crump and Harry Crump²⁰.

Crump had a subdivision plan drawn up of the land he had acquired along Brougham Street and a newly formed private street out of the adjoining College Site Reserve in 1901.²¹ Prior to the name Paterson Crump had named the street Laureston, most likely after the name that was given to the house by Frances Grant. In 1904 Reverend James Paterson passed away. He was one of the New Zealand's leading churchmen and had retired from the charge of St. John's Presbyterian Church in 1903. Paterson was also Governor of nearby Wellington College and from 1877 to 1903 a member of its Senate. After his death three city

¹⁵ Laureston House, Brougham Street, 189?, Reference No. 1/2-017986-F, Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington (Timeframes).

¹⁶ *Evening Post*, 24 February 1891, p.3 (Papers Past)

¹⁷ Thomas Ward plan, 1891, Sheet No.70, City of Wellington, Wellington City Archives.

¹⁸ CT WN40/53.

¹⁹ *Cyclopedia of NZ* Volume 1 1897, p.602.

²⁰ *Stones Wellington Street Directory, 1903 & 1904, Kensington Street.*

²¹ Deposited Plan 1172, 1901, LINZ.

councillors successfully sought the change of name of the street to Paterson in his honour. It was not until 1917 that it became a public street.²²

Crump built a number of houses along Brougham and Paterson Street and progressively sold off the land and buildings. However, he continued to live in the house at no. 7 and newspapers advertisements record his address as Brougham Street until its sale in 1909. Irvine-Smith records Crump as living in Dunedin in 1948 and quotes his age as 92. His legacy is his enduring contribution to the built heritage of Wellington and the shape of the historic suburb of Mount Victoria.

In 1907/08, Crump tried to sell the property to Charles Odlin, but the sale fell through. In 1909 it was bought by Archbishop Francis Redwood and Father Thomas O'Shea for the Catholic Church.²³ A further transfer of land that adjoins Part of Lot 5 DP 1172 was made to Redwood and O'Shea from Harry Crump in 1912.²⁴

Roman Catholic Church (owner 1909-1989)

In 1909, 7 Paterson St became a residence for Father O'Shea, parish priest of St Joseph's, and the other priests serving the Te Aro parish. Prior to the move to Paterson Street O'Shea had bought a small property at 46 Buckle Street as a residence. In 1913 O'Shea was consecrated Coadjutor-Archbishop to Archbishop Redwood and a torchlight procession went from Paterson Street, down Ellice Street to his consecration in the Town Hall.²⁵ With the passing of Redwood in January 1935 O'Shea became Archbishop and from that point on, it became known as Archbishop's House. Archbishop O'Shea resided at no. 7 until he was hospitalised prior to his death in 1954.

In 1915 plans were drawn up by the architect John Sydney Swan for an addition of a small cottage that would have an internal access way into the Presbytery.²⁶ Swan was responsible for a number of significant projects for the Catholic community in Wellington including St Gerard's Church, Erskine College and the Home of Compassion Crèche in Buckle Street.

A photograph of the presbytery in 1933 shows the building to have some dilapidation with drip mouldings in disrepair.²⁷ It was a few years later that architectural plans for major alterations to the exterior and interior of the Presbytery were drawn up by the architect Bertie Fleming Kelly in 1936.²⁸ The project also included the addition of a three storey reinforced concrete Art Deco block of flats that would provide further accommodation with two internal access ways between the buildings. Construction of the 1936 block meant that the 1915 Swan addition had to be removed and specifications for the build required the reuse of materials wherever possible.²⁹

B.F. Kelly was responsible for a number of designs for the Wellington Catholic community including schools, churches, a presbytery in Kilbirnie and alterations and additions to the Covent of the Sacred Heart (now Erskine College).³⁰ Kelly was educated at St Patrick's College, corner of Buckle and Cambridge Terrace but it is unknown where he trained as an architect. He became a practicing member of the New Zealand Institute of Architects and his practice was located on Courtenay Place.

A letter from B.F. Kelly to the Reverend Dr. A.J. McRae, Administrator, who resided at Paterson Street outlines an appeal for work with Kelly noting that he had spoken to Archbishop O'Shea who was pleased to

²² NZ Gazette, 1917, p.1978.

²³ CT WN184/156. Part Lot 5 DP 1172.

²⁴ CT WN213/63. Part Lot 5 DP 1172.

²⁵ 00233:243:1913/1493, Wellington City Archives.

²⁶ 00053:184:10113, Wellington City Archives.

²⁷ Parishes Mt. Victoria, Box 03, Wellington Archdiocese Archives.

²⁸ 00056:182:B15931, Wellington City Archives.

²⁹ Parishes Mt. Victoria, Box 03, Wellington Archdiocese Archives.

³⁰ The architectural plans for these buildings are held in the Alexander Turnbull Library Collection.

support him in 'obtaining the Catholic work.'³¹ The commission for the alterations and additions for the Paterson Street Presbytery came in 1936.

Between 1930 and 1960 the Presbytery also served as the Chancery Office and Vicariate Office for the Wellington Diocese. Title to the land was transferred from Redwood and O'Shea to Roman Catholic Archbishop in 1933.³² In the 1980s religious communities active in the parish including the Good Shepard Sisters resided at the house on Paterson Street. It was described as a 'gracious residence with big rooms'. The sisters later moved to a smaller house.

In 1989 the land was acquired for motorway purposes under the Public Works Act.³³ At that time Catholic Social Services had occupied the building but they moved to new premises in Brougham Street in October of that year.³⁴ Since that time the house has been rented out as a shared flat with many mature, long term tenants residing there.

Architectural Description and Assessment by Chris Cochran, Conservation Architect, June 2010.

The Building

The building at 7 Paterson Street is a large, two-storey house, timber-framed and clad in weatherboarding and corrugated iron. It is oriented to the north and away from Paterson Street. Today, the drive takes one alongside the west elevation of the house to a large open space on the north side; this was clearly the original approach to the house, giving access to the front verandah and main door.

The prominence of the building in the townscape is now quite slight, since the view from the road is almost entirely that of the 1936 addition – one catches a glimpse of the side elevations of the original house from Paterson Street, but the front elevation is barely visible from surrounding streets.

Architect

The house is believed to have been designed by Nicholas Marchant, Architect, who called tenders for a 'Villa for W Waring Taylor' to close on 23 January 1869. Marchant was at one time Wellington City Engineer, and was in private practice at this time in Cuba Street as a civil engineer and architect.

Plan

The plan today is a complex one, mainly because of the numerous additions and alterations that have been made throughout its life. In its original form, it appears to have had a conventional plan layout: an elegant verandah wrapped around the north and west sides of the house; the front door in the centre of the north elevation opened into a central hall, with a staircase to the first floor. A formal room opened off to the left, later enlarged by removing an internal wall and adding an octagonal tower in the north-east corner; to the right were two smaller rooms, these too having been enlarged later by the partial filling in of the west-side verandah. Towards the back of the house were smaller service rooms. Upstairs there were possibly six bedrooms, arranged in a U-shape around the main stair.

There are two staircases, the main one in the central hall, and a secondary (or servants) stair on the eastern side of the house.

Documented Changes

Records exist in the Wellington City Archives for some of the changes, as follows:

³¹ B.F. Kelly to Rev. Dr. A.J. McRae, 8 June 1934, Parishes Mt. Victoria, Box 03, Wellington Archdiocese Archives.

³² CT WN184/156 and CT WN213/63.

³³ NZ Gazette 1989, p.5102.

³⁴ 00009:1405:45/401, Wellington City Archives.

1915

A small two-roomed addition to the Catholic Presbytery, designed by John S. Swan, was built on the south side of the house, with access from a back verandah. The builder was Murdoch and Wallis. There is no trace of this now, as the 1936 addition (see below) required its demolition.

1926

A small addition was made to the western end of the 'out house', which stands in the back yard. The builder was J Moynhan.

1936

The house was radically altered at this time, to the design of architect B F Kelly. The builder was J H Meyer.

The main elevation was altered by the removal of the decorative barge boards and the reconstruction of the verandah (with the loss of timber fretwork and the original glazing) to include a 'new balcony' at first floor level. A porte cochere was added too, but this has since been demolished. Inside, alterations were made to the kitchen and adjacent service rooms on the ground floor.

A major addition was also made at this time, on the site of the 1915 addition. It is three storeys high, and contained basement, offices on the ground floor, and bedrooms and bathroom on the first floor. There were connections at ground and first floor levels to the house. It is a typical and severely simple structure of the time, built entirely in concrete.

1977

Part of the west-side verandah was filled in, and the house was repiled. (The central section of the west-side verandah is now demolished, but a remaining bay at the southern end still has the curved rafters that show the original shape of the verandah roof.)

Other changes for which there are no graphic records include:

A two-storey octagonal tower was added to the north-east corner of the house. The finish of the gable is vertical corrugated iron to match that of the original north and west-facing gables.

A garden wall was added to the west side of the house, built in masonry with moulded capping and urns (see photo in *Precious Possessions*). This wall was later demolished, and fragments of it used to build a retaining wall in the lower garden, out to the north of the house. This wall is now of some significance, since it provides evidence of the style and construction of the original wall (and is also an intriguing object in its own right, a ruin of Classical fragments).

A first-floor bathroom was added on the west side of the house (this existed in 1936).

A first-floor bathroom was added as a separate structure on the east side of the house, with access from the landing of the servant's stair (this existed in 1936). At ground level there was a toilet accessible from the garden.

Style

In its original form, the house had some of the characteristics of the Carpenter Gothic style, especially in the high gables, in the highly patterned 'drip moulding' of the barge boards, eaves and window hoods, and in the trellis work and paired posts of the verandah. An early photograph shows a very liveable house, on raised ground and well sited for sun and views, French doors opening onto the west side verandah, large double-hung windows, and the patterned timberwork mentioned. It is a thoroughly well-ordered composition, and a very handsome house of the period.

While the decorative qualities of the house are now largely lost, the original form is still recognisable. Important elements of original work remain, outside and inside, providing evidence of the high quality and standard of finish of the house. The main staircase is particularly interesting, with a wide sweeping semi-circular handrail to the top floor landing; elsewhere skirtings, architraves and panelled doors attest to the quality of the building.

Materials

The house is of conventional timber framing, clad with timber board and batten (under the verandah on the north and west sides), plain and rusticated weatherboards and, unusually, vertical corrugated iron in the north and west-facing gables. The board and batten and the corrugated iron, both running vertically, may have been used to accentuate the height of the house and the gables. (Although corrugated iron was commonly used on the side walls of houses built close together as a method of fire control, this would not have been the case with this stand-alone house; nor would it have been used as an economy, given the quality of the construction generally.) The roof is also sheathed in corrugated iron.

Throughout, flooring is timber; walls would have been scrim and paper over sarking (and this still exists in some rooms), while the ceiling lining in several rooms is pressed metal.

All joinery – doors and windows, including architraves and skirtings – are in timber with moulded profiles, now painted.

The 1936 addition is entirely built in in-situ reinforced concrete.

Summary

The building at 7 Paterson Street has significant architectural value as an example of a substantial house of the 1860s; such buildings are now very rare in Wellington. Despite extensive alterations through its 140-year life, there is sufficient original fabric remaining to allow an appreciation of its form and detail when first built, also of the standards of craftsmanship and trade skills during this early period of the development of Wellington.

It should be noted that some of the changes to the building, especially those of 1936, have significant historical interest in their own right, being made for the Catholic Archbishop of Wellington, and also some limited architectural interest as work typical of the 1930s.

Contemporary Photographs



Main entrance, north west elevation, R Murray, 2010.



Rear pedestrian entrance, south elevation, R Murray, 2010.



Pressed tin ceiling, Archbishop's room, J Newman, 2008.



Vestments warbrobe, Archbishop's room, J Newman, 2008.



Main staircase, J Newman, 2008



Servants' staircase, J Newman, 2008



Early shingle tiles under corrugated iron, N Naus, 2013