

# APPENDIX A:

## Johnsonville Community Hub Feasibility Study Comparative Site Analysis

- RATING SCALE**
- 1) Optimal
  - 2) Good
  - 3) Acceptable but not ideal
  - 4) Flawed / Problematic
  - 5) Fails to satisfy the criteria

	<b>Site One</b> Retain Library on the current site (Broderick Road)	<b>Site Two</b> Co-locate Library with swimming pool and community centre (Moorefield Road)	<b>Site Three</b> Locate Library within a redeveloped Johnsonville Mall (at first floor level)	<b>Site Four</b> Locate Library on the Mobil Site (at Intersection of Moorefield and Johnsonville Roads)
<b>1 SUITABILITY FOR FUNCTION</b>				
<b>1.1</b> Allows coordinated use of the suite of Council facilities	Fails to achieve a community hub. <b>5</b>	Depending on design allows possibility of coordination. <b>1</b>	Fails to achieve a community hub. <b>5</b>	Fails to achieve a community hub <b>5</b>
<b>1.2</b> Co-location of WCC facilities for staffing and management efficiency	Not possible. <b>5</b>	Possible, but requires replanning of existing facilities. <b>1</b>	Not possible. <b>5</b>	Not possible. <b>5</b>
<b>1.3</b> Potential quality of Library	Quality of new facility may be restricted by existing building (unless existing building is substantially altered). <b>4</b>	Provides a new purpose-built facility with two street frontages. Good potential for natural light. <b>2</b>	Quality depends on shape and extent of space provided within the mall. Outlook and daylight likely to be restricted by mid-mall location. <b>2</b>	Provides a new purpose-built facility, unless landowner requires re-occupation of the existing building. <b>3</b>
<b>2 IMAGE AND IDENTITY</b>				
<b>2.1</b> Potential contribution to visual quality and public experience of the town centre	Contribution limited by relatively obscure location. <b>3</b>	Offers potential for a high quality landmark building at a prominent street edge. <b>1</b>	Little contribution. <b>4</b>	Offers potential for a high quality landmark building at a prominent corner. <b>2</b>
<b>2.2</b> Visual quality of the immediate setting	Located close to the main street, opposite existing frontages - although this street is relatively inactive and undistinguished. <b>3</b>	Blank supermarket wall across Moorefield Rd and service entry, and Moorefield Rd is dominated by traffic. The likely site for a library is currently by the blank rear walls of the pool, and service and parking areas. Unrealised potential to connect through to Johnsonville Memorial Park. <b>3</b>	Determined by internal quality of the mall, however can be expected to be consistent with contemporary enclosed mall standards. <b>3</b>	Site is currently dominated by traffic. However visual prominence and proximity to Johnsonville Road would allow a Library here to draw from and contribute to the vitality associated with a busy main street <b>3</b>

	Site One Retain Library on the current site (Broderick Road)	Site Two Co-locate Library with swimming pool and community centre (Moorefield Road)	Site Three Locate Library within a redeveloped Johnsonville Mall (at first floor level)	Site Four Locate Library on the Mobil Site (at intersection of Moorefield and Johnsonville Roads)
<b>3 ACCESSIBILITY</b>				
3.1 Quality and ease of connection between WCC facilities for the users	Maintains existing physical separation of facilities.	Potential to integrate and provide excellent connections. This will require modification of existing buildings if connection to the pool and the park are to be provided.	WCC facilities remain physically separated.	WCC facilities remain physically separated.
	4	1	4	4
3.2 Access to and from public transport	Relatively distant from core public transport.	Wall located for access to public transport.	Ideally located for access to public transport.	Relatively distant from core public transport
	3	2	1	3
3.3 Visual prominence <i>Contributes to public awareness of the facilities</i>	Not especially prominent, as is not visible from Johnsonville Road.	Not especially prominent, as is not visible from Johnsonville Road. However a Library can potentially be located directly opposite a major entrance to the mall redevelopment, and to the railway station. Concentration of WCC facilities can raise their profile by sheer bulk and extent.	No visual presence from public space.	Highly prominent for motorists entering the town centre from the north. Location on the Johnsonville Main Road may assist with wayfinding.
	3	2	5	1
3.4 Access to carparking	Use of existing carparking can continue, however providing additional space and functions within the Library may result in this being inadequate.	Offers potential for shared use of car parking, although parking expansion limitations may cause over-subscription of parking at peak times.	Carparking is not required, with car parking provided by the mall as part of lease arrangement.	Achieving car parking may be problematic, with limited options for entry and exit close to a busy intersection.
	4	2	1	3
<b>4 CONTRIBUTION TO QUALITY OF THE PUBLIC ENVIRONMENT</b>				
4.1 Public space repair <i>A new facility should complement existing streets and spaces, connecting to them and encouraging their use. It may also form a new, high quality space or repair poor quality space.</i>	Providing an additional floor level to accommodate additional space requirements could help create a stronger more appropriate in this urban situation.	Allows repair of the poor quality edge of Council carparking fronting out to Moorefield Road. A high quality building edge including entrance functions and possibly an entrance space here could significantly enhance this corner of the block.	No contribution.	Provides potential to define edge, however likely to be in a similar way to the existing McDonalds restaurant.
	3	1	5	2
4.2 Potential connection to and integration with the Johnsonville Memorial Park	None.	Direct connection possible with reconfiguration of the south end of the swimming pool.	None.	Located 200m from the park, with access along Moorefield Road and then Frankmoore Avenue. Therefore, while the Library is not especially distant from the park, it is functionally disconnected.
	5	1	4	3

5 FEASIBILITY		Site One Retain Library on the current site (Broderick Road)	Site Two Co-locate Library with swimming pool and community centre (Moorfield Road)	Site Three Locate Library within a redeveloped Johnsonville Mall (at first floor level)	Site Four Locate Library on the Mobil Site (at intersection of Moorfield and Johnsonville Roads)
5.1	Availability and control of site	Land owned by Council.	Land owned by Council.	Feasibility depends on willingness of mall operator to include a library, and delivery depends on the timing of mall construction.	Depends on willingness of landowner to sell.
		1	1	3	2
5.2	Construction cost	Potential to reuse part of the existing facility - to be determined.	Requires a new building.	Depending on lease terms, cost might be limited to fitout only.	Requires a new building (unless the existing building is to be reoccupied).
		3	3	1	2
5.3	Operating costs	Known quantity.	Potential to achieve operating cost and staffing efficiencies given co-location of Council facilities.	Likely to be similar to the known quantity of the current situation.	Likely to be similar to the known quantity of the current situation.
		4	1	3	3
5.4	Resource Consent Constraints	Plan Change 73 indicates full site has 'Centre' zoning.	Plan Change 73 indicates that portion of the site with frontage to Moorfield Road has 'Centre' zoning, however that portion with frontage off Wanaka Street remains 'Open Space A'. This would necessitate a resource consent process.	Plan Change 73 indicates full site has 'Centre' zoning.	Plan Change 73 indicates full site has 'Centre' zoning.
		1	3	1	1
5.5	Contribution to Johnsonville Town Centre Plan <i>Well-located community facilities can contribute the amenity that attracts and provides for more intensified residential development around</i>	No change to existing situation.	Combined facilities would be located at the interface of town centre and surrounding residential, readily accessible from both. Library can be located with direct access across Moorfield Road from the railway station. High quality new facilities allow WCC to make a statement about their intent for the town centre.	Consistent with JTCP suggestion for library location in the mall. However, while accessible from within the mall, this location is inherently divorced from the residential area.	High quality new facilities allow WCC to make a statement about their intent for the town centre.
		3	1	3	3
<b>TOTAL / 16 CRITERIA (LOWEST SCORE = BEST)</b>		<b>54</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>45</b>