

Statement of proposal

Proposed revocation of the pedestrian status of Manners Mall

Overview

- 1 This statement of proposal (**statement**) invites submissions on the proposal that Wellington City Council (the **Council**) revokes the current 'pedestrian mall' status of Manners Mall to allow buses to travel. Effectively, the Council is consulting on the following two options:
 - 1.1 Retaining the 'pedestrian mall' status of Manners Mall (the 'status quo'), or
 - 1.2 Reopening Manners Mall to allow buses to travel, revoking the 'pedestrian mall' status.
- 2 Under the heading of 'retaining the pedestrian mall status', a number of sub-options have also been considered. This is explained in paragraph 35.
- 3 In addition, the Council wants to get your views on how Manners Mall should look and function if the pedestrian mall status is revoked. It is intended that a two-lane roadway be constructed through Manners Mall providing for buses to travel in both directions. This statement provides information about the status quo and proposal and includes attached plans and artist's impressions.
- 4 This statement forms part of a package of measures the Council has been investigating to 'Restore the Golden Mile' public transport route. It aims to optimise the efficiency of existing bus services and infrastructure on the part of the Golden Mile that runs between Taranaki Street and Willis/Mercer streets.
- 5 The revocation of the pedestrian mall status being considered for this route provides improvements to bus capacity, journey time, reliability and a response to growing network congestion.
- 6 This statement includes:
 - 6.1 The proposal – revoking the 'pedestrian mall' status and reopening Manners Mall to allow buses to travel
 - 6.2 Background to the 'pedestrian mall'
 - 6.3 What's happened so far – consultation and process to date.
 - 6.4 The reasons for the proposal – including the benefits and disadvantages to individuals and the public.

- 6.5 An analysis of the reasonably practicable alternative options available, including an analysis of the proposal to open up Manners Mall to allow buses to travel and create a 'shared' space in lower Cuba Street, and an analysis of the alternatives that involve retaining the pedestrian mall status.

Have your say

- 7 The consultation period runs from 29 September 2009 to 30 October 2009. Additional copies of this statement of proposal may be viewed online at www.Wellington.govt.nz, obtained from a Wellington City Council service centre or requested by phone (499 4444).
- 7.1 Submissions on the statement may be made to the Council from 29 September until 5.00pm on 30 October 2009. Submissions can be made:
- Electronically at www.Wellington.govt.nz
 - By email to goldenmile@wcc.govt.nz with "Manners Mall" in the subject line
 - Or, in writing to Wellington City Council:

Manners Mall Consultation
c/- Joelene Noble
Freepost 2199
PO Box 2199
WELLINGTON
- 7.2 Any person who makes a submission will have the opportunity to be heard by the Council, but must make that request. Oral submissions will be heard by Council from 9 November 2009.
- 7.3 The Local Government Act 2002 requires the Council to make all written submissions on this consultation available to the public. This requirement is subject to the provisions of the Local Government Official Information Act and Meetings Act 1987.
- 8 Section 336(3) of the Local Government Act 1974 provides a right of appeal to the Environment Court. Any person who wishes to appeal the Council's decision needs to do so within one month of the Council making its decision on whether or not to revoke the pedestrian mall status.

How to get more information

- 9 Further information, including the reports referred to in this document, is available on the Council's website www.Wellington.govt.nz

The proposal – revoking the 'pedestrian mall' status and reopening Manners Mall to allow buses to travel

- 10 This statement is to re-open Manners Mall to allow buses to travel.
- 11 It is proposed that a two-lane roadway be constructed through what was Manners Mall so buses can travel in both directions. Wide footpaths would be constructed on either side of the street to cater for the high volumes of pedestrians that will continue to use this route. The layout of what is now Manners Mall would be similar in character and dimensions to the section of Manners Street between the current Manners Mall and Willis Street.
- 12 It is also intended to reconfigure lower Cuba Street (an area of about 2600 square metres) as a shared space to compensate for the loss of public space in Manners Mall caused by opening it to bus travel.
- 13 The attached plans and artist impressions show what is proposed for Manners Street (formerly Manners Mall) and lower Cuba Street in regard to look and function. A draft concept plan for the area bounded by Willis Street, Wakefield Street, Taranaki Street and Dixon Street which provides a wider context for the proposals is on page I of the attachment.
- 14 Should the pedestrian mall status be revoked, further consultation will be undertaken on detailed aspects of the traffic and transport operations. This will include any parking changes to time limited/ metered parking, taxi stands, loading zones, motorcycle parks and bus stops and the location of bus shelters.

History and background to the 'pedestrian mall'

- 15 Prior to 1979, the section of Manners Street that is now Manners Mall (that portion of Manners Street lying between Cuba and Victoria Streets) was part of the original tram route (and subsequent bus route) through the city and was a road used by general traffic. The pedestrian Mall was established in 1979 by Council resolution. Minor amendments to the relevant resolution were made in 1981 and 1986.
- 16 The current status was agreed by Council resolution on 6 July 1994 under section 336 of the Local Government Act 1974 (**LGA 1974**) which declared Manners and Cuba Street Malls to be 'pedestrian malls' under the LGA 1974 and that, subject to some exceptions, the driving or parking of any vehicle on those parts of Cuba and Manners streets be prohibited.
- 17 To be able to change the prohibition on driving of vehicles through what is now Manners Mall, the Council needs to undertake the special consultative procedure set out in the Local Government Act 2002 (**LGA 2002**). This statement is part of that process.

What's happened so far?

18 The Council's 2006 Transport Strategy¹ sets out the overarching plan for the development and management of the city's transport system. The strategy makes it clear that bus priority measures are an essential means of providing for the city's transport needs now and in the future. One of the four priorities in the strategy is:

We will improve the performance of the city's passenger transport system through bus priority measures.

19 In April 2007, the Council's Strategy and Policy Committee formally reconfirmed the importance of bus lanes to the city's transport system and requested that officers do further work to develop a prioritised programme.

20 In April 2008, the Council approved a trial of taxis in bus lanes and noted that bus priority schemes were being developed firstly for Courtenay Place, Kent/Cambridge Terraces and Taranaki Street, followed by the central city. In May 2008, the New Zealand Transport Agency approved the Council's application for funding of \$10.7m over 10 years for the implementation of bus priority measures across the city.

21 In June 2008, the Council agreed to consult on a number of options for improving bus journey times and traffic management in Courtenay Place together with plans for bus lanes on Kent and Cambridge Terraces and Taranaki Street. In response to further work and advice, the Council decided to investigate a more holistic approach to bus priority in the city that identified and prioritised those measures that would provide the greatest benefits along the entire Golden Mile bus route, which runs from Wellington Railway Station to the Cambridge Terrace end of Courtenay Place. Accordingly, in mid-2008, Council officers undertook a comprehensive analysis of the functioning of this route in consultation with Greater Wellington Regional Council² and bus operators. The result of this analysis was a package of measures referred to as "Restoring the Golden Mile" and further explained in paragraphs 26 and 27.

22 This work was influenced and informed by the Ngauranga to Airport Transport Plan, (then in draft and adopted in October 2008), which is the most comprehensive study of the city's transport needs completed to date. It provides a blueprint for development of the city's main traffic routes, including passenger transport, walking, cycling and general traffic. The plan proposes a major role for public transport in meeting the future transport

¹ *Transport Strategy – providing quality connections*, Wellington City Council, July 2006, page 9

² Responsible for the provision of public transport services in the city.

needs of the city. It contains the following measure, which provides further support to the proposal in this statement :

Implement passenger transport improvements (including bus priority measures, signal pre-emption, real time information) along the Golden Mile route to improve journey times, reliability and passenger waiting and boarding provisions³.

- 23 In addition to the strategic documents outlined above, further support for the proposal came from operational monitoring data undertaken by Greater Wellington Regional Council. This data revealed that the bus system in the city is not functioning as efficiently as it should, particularly during peak periods when buses become significantly less reliable against timetables⁴. Travel time delays to bus services are recorded by bus companies on some segments of the Golden Mile as increasing from 1 minute to traverse a segment, to over 15 minutes in peak periods⁵. Golden Mile bus travel times – from the station to the Cambridge Terrace end of Courtenay Place – vary from 12 minutes at uncongested times to over 25 minutes for the same journey in the afternoon peak⁶.
- 24 This variability and unreliability makes it difficult to timetable and schedule buses, leading to inefficiencies (more buses on the road at one time due to congestion impacts) and higher operational costs. It also discourages potential users of public transport⁷.
- 25 Traffic modelling work carried out for Wellington City Council by Opus International Consultants (August 2008) established that future traffic growth on the CBD network will lead to growing congestion, which will continue to affect bus journey times and reliability.
- 26 The ‘Restoring the Golden Mile’ package built on work previously undertaken by the Council, including improvements to the bus lanes in Lambton Quay, implementation of a 30 km/hr speed limit and pedestrian improvements. These measures were aimed at optimising the efficiency of the existing bus network and infrastructure. The package of improvements was developed in consultation with the bus companies whose bus drivers identified the parts of the route that caused the most delays. A report containing transport

³ *Ngauranga to Wellington Airport Corridor Plan*, Greater Wellington Regional Council, October 2008, page 9.

⁴ Greater Wellington Regional Council operational monitoring 2008.

⁵ Bus travel time Manners Street west from Victoria to Mercer, NZ Bus Survey Information, 2007

⁶ Source: Greater Wellington Regional Council Public Transportation Division, 2008

⁷ GWRC Annual Public Transport Satisfaction Survey, July 2008: 87% rate reliability as important but only 62% say expectations are met.

modelling and analysis was completed by Opus International Consultants⁸. A retail impact assessment report was undertaken by Jones Lang LaSalle⁹. This report commented on the possible reintroduction of two-way bus traffic in Manners Street east (the Courtenay Place end) and Manners Mall and possible impacts on the mix of retail and office uses. The Council undertook pedestrian surveys to establish volumes and directions of flows. It also undertook parking surveys to establish uses of on-street parking and its importance to surrounding businesses and residents.

- 27 On 9 October 2008 the Council considered a package of proposals designed to improve the performance of the bus system along the Golden Mile. It agreed to consult on the following measures:
- re-routing buses through Manners Mall
 - reducing speed limits between Courtenay Place and Willis Streets to 30 km/h
 - banning the right turn from Victoria Street into Manners Street west (Willis Street end)
 - signalling the three pedestrian crossings in Courtenay Place
 - public space and street improvements in Manners Street east, Dixon Street, lower Cuba Street, Wakefield Street, Willis Street, Mercer Street and Victoria Street.
- 28 Preliminary consultation had been undertaken with key stakeholders and local businesses in mid-2008, and formal consultation was held in November and December of that year. An extensive public consultation process was carried out (including brochures, flyers, advertising, direct contact with businesses, posters and an information stall in Manners Mall). In addition, an on-line survey was commissioned from AC Nielsen from a sample of 500 Wellington residents. An on-line petition was also organised by a resident of lower Cuba Street which attracted 1595 responses in opposition to opening Manners Mall to buses. 722 submissions were received through the public consultation process and oral hearings were held to hear the submitters who wished to be heard.
- 29 In response to concerns expressed in submissions, the original measures consulted on were revised to include a proposal to create a 'shared space' in lower Cuba Street. This shared space would mitigate the loss of pedestrian space in Manners Mall from the re-opening of the mall to allow buses to travel. It was proposed that the shared space would:
- continue the design 'feel' from Cuba Mall to retain continuity and reinforce the pedestrian link to Civic Square (pavers, planter boxes, trees etc)

⁸ *Restoring the Golden Mile – Taranaki to Willis Street*, Final Evaluation Report May 2009, Opus International Consultants.

⁹ *Scoping Report for Segment of Golden Mile*, Jones Lang LaSalle, 8 September 2008.

- allow limited vehicle access to provide servicing and parking for local businesses and access to businesses in Manners Street east
- feature parallel parking instead of the current angle parks to reduce its density and impact on the space
- include design features to aid in reducing vehicle speeds to a walking pace – vehicles would be required to give way to pedestrians
- have some pedestrian-only areas (probably near the Manners Street end)
- be designed so traffic could be excluded for events (e.g. the Cuba Carnival).

30 At its meeting on 4 June 2009, the Council's Strategy and Policy Committee considered the consultation undertaken on the Golden Mile bus priority and public space proposals and agreed to commence the revocation of the 'pedestrian mall' status of Manners Mall. It was noted that the special consultative procedure would be required and reported to Council for approval. The decisions of the Strategy and Policy Committee were noted by the Council on 29 June 2009.

31 A sum of \$11.1m for construction of the 'Golden Mile' package of projects, including the proposal to open Manners Mall to buses and construction of a shared space in lower Cuba Street is included in the Council's Long-Term Council Community Plan 2009-2019 which was finalised in July 2009. This includes \$4.9m for public space improvements (lower Cuba, Manners Mall, Willis, Dixon, and Mercer) and \$6.2m for transport improvements (overhead wires, construction of a carriageway through Manners Mall, signalling pedestrian crossings and intersection improvements). It also includes a subsidy of up to \$3.3m from the NZ Transport Agency towards the transport improvements.

Reasons for the proposal to open up Manners Mall to allow bus travel

32 Bus operations through the Wellington CBD and along the Golden Mile are currently unreliable with significant delays for a large number of bus services during both peak and inter-peak periods. A study by Opus International Consultants¹⁰ has confirmed that public transport growth in the study area is predicted to increase significantly (between 10% and 30% during peak periods) until 2016 and then maintain lower growth beyond this period through to 2026. This growth will place increasing pressure on existing operations and infrastructure, highlighting the need for short-to-medium-term enhancements to the parts of the route where reliability and operational conditions are poor and where infrastructure and services could be improved.

33 The existing layout of the bus route between Willis and Taranaki streets results in significant delay, congestion, and journey time variability particularly in a northbound direction. The split route also makes it difficult

¹⁰ *Restoring the Golden Mile – Taranaki to Willis Street*, Final Evaluation Report May 2009, Opus International Consultants.

for people who are not familiar with the area to work out where to catch a bus. Opus and the bus operators believe the proposal to open Manners Mall to allow buses to travel is the single most beneficial change to both bus travel times and reliability along the Golden Mile.

An analysis of the reasonably practicable alternative options

- 34 Section 87 of the LGA 2002 requires the Council to analyse the 'reasonably practicable' alternative options and the proposal. Section 336 of the LGA 1974 contemplates three options:
- 34.1 Status quo – that is, retaining the 'pedestrian mall' status, or
 - 34.2 Revoking the 'pedestrian mall' status – that is, reopening Manners Mall to establish a two-way bus route, or
 - 34.3 Varying the 'pedestrian mall' status – that is, altering the current pedestrian mall status so that it allows vehicles, but still retains its 'pedestrian mall' status.
- 35 The status quo option also has 3 variations¹¹:
- 35.1 A - leave the 'pedestrian mall' status in place with buses travelling along the same routes as at present, but ban the right turn from Victoria Street into Manners Street west.
 - 35.2 B - establish a two-way bus route via Mercer, Wakefield, lower Cuba and Manners Street east.
 - 35.3 C - establish a two-way bus route via Dixon Street and upper Willis Street.
- 36 While section 336 of the LGA 1974 gives the Council the power to vary the pedestrian mall status, rather than revoke it (paragraph 34.3 above), the Council considers that this option is impractical. It is illogical to classify an area a 'pedestrian mall', but at the same time allow it to be used consistently by vehicles. If it was reopened to buses, Manners Mall would not be a predominantly pedestrian area and in the Council's view, it would not be appropriate to remain as a 'pedestrian mall'.
- 37 For this reason, the Council's view is that varying the 'pedestrian mall' status to allow regular use by buses is not reasonably practicable and therefore, it has not analysed this option any further. Effectively, this leaves two options for assessment (one of which has several variations).

¹¹ Ibid.

An analysis of the proposal to revoke the pedestrian status of Manners Mall and allow buses to travel and create a shared space in lower Cuba Street

- 38 Shared spaces are designed to combine the functions of streets so that different street users have equal entitlement and priority to the space. They seek to improve the living environment for people, without needing to restrict or banish motorised traffic, by reducing traffic speeds through design. Shared spaces have been successfully introduced in a number of countries, most extensively in the Netherlands as well as Germany, Denmark, Sweden, Switzerland and the UK.
- 39 Three scenarios have been considered for the creation of shared space in lower Cuba Street and a table assessing their respective strengths and weaknesses is included on page VII of the attachment. The preferred scenario is described in more detail in pages VIII- XI of the attachment.
- 40 The main benefits of the proposal to revoke the pedestrian status of Manners Mall to allow buses to travel are:
- 40.1 Significant improvements in public transport reliability and reductions in bus travel times between Taranaki and Willis streets as confirmed by the Opus report¹².
 - 40.2 Significant improvements to walkability by creating an improved pedestrian axis linking Cuba Mall to Civic Square and the waterfront.
 - 40.3 Significant improvement to the ease of understanding or legibility of public transport services in the area by eliminating the current 'split route' and placing all bus services on a single route through the area.
 - 40.4 Significant improvement to the legibility of walking routes and public space in the area by creating a linear pedestrian space running from Cuba Mall to Civic Square.
 - 40.5 An important first step in implementing the Ngauranga to Airport Transport Plan by upgrading the central city public transport route to link in with other proposed infrastructure improvements in the plan.

¹² The Opus report analysed two versions of the proposal to open up Manners Mall to buses. Version D assumed that the current direction of traffic flow through lower Cuba Street remained the same as at present and version D(i) assumed that this flow was reversed so that traffic flowed in a northbound direction.

- 40.6 An integral part of a holistic package of measures to improve the performance of the central city public transport spine, which is a key part of the Council's Urban Development and Transport strategies.
 - 40.7 Is a necessary pre-condition for a future significant change in the city's public transport system (under the Ngauranga to Airport Plan) which could take the form of bus rapid transport.
 - 40.8 Establishes a clear framework for future development of this area around a coherent vehicle / public transport / walking network that assigns priority to particular modes of travel on particular parts of the network in line with best practice in transport and urban development. This would provide an east-west public transport route and a north-south pedestrian route.
 - 40.9 Provides a net improvement in public space in the area by slightly increasing the area of public space through the lower Cuba shared space, a more logical sequence of public spaces and improved connections between them.
 - 40.10 Responds to advice received from bus operators and Greater Wellington Regional Council that improvements to the performance of the bus network are required to meet the future public transport requirements of the city.
 - 40.11 Eases growing bus congestion.
 - 40.12 Obtains maximum value from past and current investment in transport networks and public spaces.
 - 40.13 Provides good economic performance (benefit-cost ratio¹³).
- 41 The main disadvantages are:
- 41.1 The financial cost of constructing a new roadway and overhead trolley wires in what is now Manners Mall and shared space in lower Cuba Street.
 - 41.2 The potential impact on retailers along what is now Manners Mall resulting from changes to pedestrian movements or the perceived attractiveness of the location.
 - 41.3 The reduction in existing public space in what is now Manners Mall.

¹³ The benefit-cost ratio of a project is the ratio of benefits to costs. Any number greater than 1 indicates that the project is worth undertaking.

- 42 The Opus report estimates the benefit-cost ratio of the project as being 2.3, which is considered to be high for a passenger transport project. The bus operators, in previous submissions, indicated that the proposals would significantly improve the utilisation of buses and in the longer term, reduce future investment required to provide services required by Wellingtonians.
- 43 The most significant disadvantage of the original proposal consulted on in November and December 2008, as identified by submitters, was the loss of pedestrian public space in Manners Mall. In response to this concern, the Council developed the current proposal to create shared space in lower Cuba Street which will mitigate the loss of public space in Manners Mall.
- 44 The public space in Manners Mall currently provides social and cultural benefits for people to meet and interact and for buskers and street performers. If the mall is opened up for buses to travel, the proposed shared space in lower Cuba Street will mitigate the loss of these benefits. For large-scale events (e.g. Cuba Carnival), the lower Cuba Street shared space would be closed to vehicles. Further details on the shared space scenarios for lower Cuba Street are included in the attachment, see page VII.
- 45 The economic impacts of the proposal were considered in the Jones Lang LaSalle retail assessment completed in September 2008. The report found:
- Efficient public transport and proposed enhancement of streetscapes are likely to benefit retail and commercial premises
 - Gradual changes in the surrounding social and commercial environment on completion of the subject project can trigger refurbishment to existing malls that have become functionally obsolescent
 - Retailers along Manners Mall are likely to benefit from the increased exposure as a result of the proposed changes to transport networks and streetscape
 - Proposed changes are likely to further enhance the subject area's cafe and restaurant atmosphere
 - Additional on-street car parks are likely to promote pedestrian flows and may provide funding towards any improvements made
 - Proposed changes may be beneficial for future introduction of light-rail.
 - Positioning of bus stops in the area will be important to avoid possible congestion. Investigation into this has been undertaken.
 - Incentives for people to stop in the area and impacts on local retailers during the redevelopment process need to be investigated.
 - Proposed changes may increase commuters travelling times to office buildings along Dixon Street and Wakefield Street.
 - Low vacancy rates in the subject area indicate pedestrian flow and the current traffic network for retailers works well with current retail mix.
- 46 Economic impacts were also addressed during the consultation held in November-December 2008, with submissions received from local businesses on the idea of opening up the Mall to buses. Reasons given for supporting the proposal included achieving transport benefits with little real impact on businesses, cleaning up and revitalising the area, ensuring better security and

encouraging more foot traffic. Reasons given for opposing the proposal included adverse effects on foot traffic, not enough room for buses in Manners Mall, effect of diesel fumes, low time savings for buses, increased accidents, increase in noise, construction disruption, loss of parking or loading zones and the negative effects caused by people waiting at bus stops.

47 The Regional Chamber of Commerce supported the proposal because of the transport benefits and cited a survey amongst their members showing 56% support. The NZ Retailers' Association submission indicated that there was a variety of views amongst its members and reiterated the concerns from opponents set out in the previous paragraph.

48 The proposal is expected to have a positive environmental impact by reducing bus travel times and improving journey times through the city. This is expected to result in lower energy use and fewer emissions, as addressed in the Opus traffic modelling. Travel time improvements and greater journey reliability are also expected to encourage greater use of public transport.

49 The negative environmental impacts of the proposal involve increases in diesel bus emissions in some locations with a corresponding decrease in emissions in other locations. The reductions in emissions will occur along the current bus routes northbound along Dixon and Victoria Street and southbound along Mercer, Wakefield and lower Cuba Streets. Increases in emissions will occur along Manners Street (including the Mall) which will become a two-way bus route. The proposals are expected to improve bus travel times through the city and reduce delays at bus stops.

50 The proposal contributes strongly to the community outcomes as set out in the 2009-2019 Long Term Council Community Plan as follows:

Wellington's public transport system will be accessible and affordable for all

By improving the transit times, reliability and legibility of the bus system, opening up Manners Mall to buses will significantly improve the accessibility of the inner city and in particular, the area along Manners Street.

Wellington's transport system will be designed to meet the needs of its people efficiently and sustainably.

The Opus report confirms that the proposal will significantly improve the efficiency of the bus system by reducing travel times and increasing reliability. Travel time reductions will also contribute to the sustainability of the system through reductions in energy and fossil fuel use.

Wellington city and its amenities will be accessible to all Wellingtonians.

An efficient bus system provides an essential service to the elderly, disabled and people without cars. The proposals will positively contribute to the efficiency of the bus system through the city, and overall accessibility. It will

also contribute to efficiencies for the city's workforce accessing the centre of employment.

Wellington will be pedestrian and cycle friendly.

An efficient bus system is necessary to support a pedestrian friendly city. It is impracticable for people to walk from distant suburbs. The bus system allows people to bus into the city and then walk around it once they get here. The improvements to the bus service arising from this proposal are expected to contribute to the city's pedestrian friendliness.

These proposals will also benefit pedestrians by creating a new, pedestrian priority link (the shared space) between Cuba Mall and Civic Square. At the same time, wide footpaths of approximately 4.5 meters will remain on each side of what is now Manners Mall. Moreover, the area concept plan (attached) also envisages the construction of pedestrian improvements at the Willis–Manners intersection, on Dixon Street, at the Cuba-Manners intersection, widened footpaths on Wakefield Street, and improvements to the Wakefield-Victoria street intersection, a narrowed crossing between Mercer Street and Civic Square and a new crossing at the Willis–Mercer intersection.

The creation of a shared space in lower Cuba Street will also provide a cycle friendly and safe route from Cuba Mall and Manners Street to Civic Square and the waterfront.

Wellingtonians' use of non-renewable energy resources will decrease.

Wellington will promote the sustainable management of the environment and support increased opportunities for the exercise of kaitiakitanga or environmental guardianship.

The improvements to travel times and reliability through the city will contribute to reductions in the use of fossil fuels by both diesel buses and thermally generated electric power used by trolley buses.

Wellington's traffic will flow smoothly through and around the city and its suburbs.

The proposal will result in a smoother and more reliable flow of buses through the city.

Retaining the 'pedestrian mall' status

- 51 Manners Mall consists of a pedestrian space of about 1900 square metres. It experiences a high volume of pedestrian traffic with the peak period occurring between 11.30 am and 1.00 pm with approximately 3800 people per hour moving through in both directions, as confirmed by Council surveys. These surveys show that a very small percentage of pedestrians linger in the Mall with only 4% spending over 5 minutes in one location, confirming that the Mall is predominantly used as a pedestrian throughway rather than a destination in itself. If the pedestrian mall status is revoked to allow bus travel

the remaining area of pedestrian space on the wide footpaths will be approximately 1150 square metres.

- 52 The main benefits of retaining the pedestrian Mall status are:
- 52.1 Saving of the financial costs required to re-open Manners Mall and construct the shared space in lower Cuba Street.
 - 52.2 The public space in Manners Mall remains as it is for continuing use by the public.
 - 52.3 There are no changes to Manners Mall that could potentially impact on retailers.
- 53 The main disadvantages of retaining the pedestrian Mall status are:
- 53.1 There is no improvement in public transport reliability, travel times or legibility.
 - 53.2 Existing operations and infrastructure will be put under increasing pressure resulting in further delay, congestion and unreliability.
 - 53.3 No improvement in walkability between Cuba Mall, Civic Square and the Waterfront and no improvement in legibility of walking routes and public space.
 - 53.4 Opportunity cost of lost economic performance, through transport network inefficiencies.

Alternatives Whilst Retaining Status Quo– options A, B and C

- 54 The Opus report considered 4 options, options A, B and C as set out in 35 above which are alternatives for leaving the pedestrian Mall status in place and option D¹⁴ for opening the Mall to bus traffic. It established that options A, B and C are significantly less effective in reducing bus travel times and reliability through the section of the bus network from Taranaki to Willis Street than option D. Moreover, because these options retain the current split route arrangement, they do not address legibility issues.
- 55 The financial costs of options A, B and C range from \$470,000 to \$5.3m and are set out in the Opus report. These costs are not directly comparable with the costs of option D because they do not include the costs and benefits of public space improvements in lower Cuba Street and elsewhere. The Opus report estimates the benefit-cost ratios of these options as ranging from 0.8 to

¹⁴ The report also considered a variant of the Manners Mall option which reversed the current traffic direction.

1.6. The options maintain the current inefficiencies in the bus network and will therefore require additional investment in buses by operators to meet the city's needs in the future.

56 By retaining the inefficiencies in the current bus network, options A to C will result in increasingly inefficient levels of fossil fuel use and emissions as bus passenger numbers grow¹⁵.

57 The Opus report included the following table providing an overall summary of the options, including the option of opening the Mall to buses:

	Modified Status Quo - Option A	Wakefield Street - Option B	Dixon Street - Option C	Opening Manners Mall to bus travel Option D
Benefit to Cost Ratio	1.6	1.6	0.8	2.3
Base Capital Cost	\$470,000	\$5.312m	\$4.287m	\$5.411m
% Contingency	53%	73%	66%	68%
Transportation costs	\$4,619	\$4,599	\$4,611	\$4,620
Passenger Transport Performance	Neutral / Little Change	Good	Poor	Very Good
Bus Route Legibility / Accessibility	Very Poor	Poor	Very poor	Good
Linking Public Spaces	Neutral / Little Change	Poor	Very Poor	Very good
Pedestrian Amenity	Neutral / Little Change	Good	Poor	Good

58 Options A to C will result in the following effects on the community outcomes:

Wellington's public transport system will be accessible and affordable for all

¹⁵ Although improvements in vehicle technology are likely to result in improved fuel efficiency over time, against this base case scenario, options A-C will result in increases in fuel use.

Because these options fail to significantly improve transit times, reliability and legibility of the bus system, their contribution to this outcome will be minimal.

Wellington's transport system will be designed to meet the needs of its people efficiently and sustainably.

By failing to significantly improve the efficiency of the bus system through reduced travel times and increased reliability these options will not contribute meaningfully to this outcome. Travel times will continue to increase.

Wellington city and its amenities will be accessible to all Wellingtonians.

An efficient bus system provides an essential service to the elderly, disabled and people without cars. These options will not provide significant improvements to this outcome.

Wellington will be pedestrian and cycle friendly.

An efficient bus system is necessary to support a pedestrian friendly city. Bus travel times through this section of the city are increasing and reliability is reducing, and these options would do little to reverse these trends.

Wellingtonians' use of non-renewable energy resources will decrease.

Wellington will promote the sustainable management of the environment and support increased opportunities for the exercise of kaitiakitanga or environmental guardianship.

Currently, travel times and reliability through the city are diminishing, contributing to growing use of fossil fuels by both diesel buses and thermally generated electric power used by trolley buses. These options will do little to reverse this trend.

Wellington's traffic will flow smoothly through and around the city and its suburbs.

The options will do little to assist the smooth and reliable flow of buses through the city.

Conclusion

- 59 It is proposed that a two lane roadway be constructed through Manners Mall providing for buses to travel in both directions. Wide footpaths would be constructed on either side of the roadway to cater for the high volumes of pedestrians that will continue to use this route. The layout of Manners Street (formerly Manners Mall) would be similar in character and dimensions to the section of Manners Street between the current Manners Mall and Willis Street. It is also intended to develop lower Cuba Street as a shared pedestrian space to mitigate the loss of public space in Manners Mall caused by revoking the pedestrian status to allow buses to travel.

Proposed revocation of the pedestrian status of Manners Mall Submission Form

Wellington City Council is seeking your feedback on a proposal to revoke the pedestrian status of Manners Mall, to allow bus travel.

We also want your views on creating a shared space in lower Cuba Street to mitigate the loss of pedestrian space in Manners Mall and better connect Cuba Mall to Civic Square.

Submissions close 5.00pm, Friday 30 October 2009 and can be made on this form and mailed to Freepost 2199, Manners Mall Consultation, Wellington City Council, Wellington. Submissions can also be made online at www.Wellington.govt.nz or by emailing goldenmile@wcc.govt.nz

Any person who makes a submission will have the opportunity to be heard by the Council, but must make that request. Oral submissions will be heard by Council from 9 November 2009.

All submissions (including names and contact details) are published and made available to elected members and the public. Personal information will also be used for the administration of the consultation process. All information collected will be held by Wellington City Council, 101 Wakefield Street, with submitters having the right to access and correct personal information.

First name(s)

Last name

Street address

Phone

Email

I am writing this submission (tick box)

As an individual

On behalf of an organisation

Name of organisation

Do you wish to speak to the Committee in support of your submission?

Yes

No

Your comments

What do you think of the proposal to revoke the pedestrian status of Manners Mall to allow buses to travel through?

What do you think about the lower Cuba Street shared space scenarios and preferred scenario to mitigate the loss of pedestrian space in Manners Mall?