Before the Hearings Commissioners at Wellington City Council

under: the Resource Management Act 1991

in the matter of: an application by Ryman Healthcare Limited for

resource consent to construct, operate and maintain a comprehensive care retirement village at 26 Donald Street and 37 Campbell Street, Karori, Wellington

between: Ryman Healthcare Limited

Applicant

and: Wellington City Council

Consent Authority

Summary Statement of **Rebecca Anne Skidmore** on behalf of Ryman Healthcare Limited

Dated: 13 September 2022

Reference: Luke Hinchey (luke.hinchey@chapmantripp.com)
Nicola de Wit (nicola.dewit@chapmantripp.com)



SUMMARY STATEMENT OF REBECCA ANNE SKIDMORE ON BEHALF OF RYMAN HEALTHCARE LIMITED

1 My full name is Rebecca Anne Skidmore. My qualifications and experience are set out in my statement of evidence dated 29 August 2022.

The Site and its context

- The Site is located within a well-established neighbourhood that, while predominantly residential, contains a diverse mix of activities. The scale of the Site, its former use, urban structure, and collection of built elements has established the Site as a landmark within the predominantly residential neighbourhood.
- 3 Using the terminology contained in the District Plan, the Site can be described as a 'windfall' site that provides particular opportunity to take a comprehensive approach to development and achieve residential intensification through establishing a comprehensive care retirement village.

Landscape Effects

- I consider that the Proposed Village will reinforce the distinctive character and landmark qualities of the Site. Retention of the former Teachers' College buildings adjacent to the Donald Street frontage, together with the retention of a large portion and restoration of the Lopdell Gardens, will provide a visual link to the Site's history and will continue to make a positive contribution to the neighbourhood's character and distinctive sense of place.
- The Proposed Village will result in an increased scale and density of buildings on the Site. However, unlike the former collection of buildings, the design of the various built elements will be residential in character. While referencing the former 'brutalist' style, the overall collection of buildings will appear more domestic in character. Extensive planting with a range of ornamental trees will further enhance this residential character. The extensive planting will also mitigate the loss of some vegetation. The typology of apartment buildings will differ from the surrounding predominant pattern of stand-alone dwellings. However, the location, scale and design of the buildings has been carefully considered so that they will, in my opinion, integrate well with the surrounding environment.
- Together with a range of non-residential activities in the wider neighbourhood, and in the context of the character established by the former Teachers' College, I consider the Proposed Village will

- make a positive contribution to the evolution of the neighbourhood character.
- In my opinion, the policy framework of the Proposed Plan lends additional support to the change in landscape character that will result from the Proposed Village.

Visual Effects

- 8 My assessment identifies the primary viewing audience for the Proposed Village as comprising four groups.
- The assessment finds that the magnitude of visual change will vary considerably for the various groups. In the context of the landmark qualities of the Site established by the Teachers' College and the relevant planning provisions, including the identification of 'windfall sites' within residential environments being suitable for intensification, the assessment finds that the resulting effects will vary from moderate adverse to positive. From some locations, as proposed planting becomes established, particularly around the perimeter of the Site, adverse visual effects will be reduced. For a limited number of residential properties adverse visual effects will be reduced to, or remain, low following the establishment of planting. For all other properties, effects will be very low to positive.
- 10 When considered in relation to the Proposed Plan framework, I consider the magnitude of adverse visual effects experienced by those viewing the Proposed Village from proximate viewpoints will be the same or less than that assessed in the LVA.

Submissions

- 11 A number of submissions address issues related to landscape and visual effects. The submissions express a range of opinions about the suitability of the Site to accommodate the Proposed Village and its effects on the character and amenity of the immediate and wider context. My evidence considers and comments on the landscape and visual issues raised.
- I note that, since preparing my evidence, an amended submission has been received from the owner of 40 Campbell Street (Submission 67). The amended submission raises concerns about the visual effects of the Proposed Village when viewed from this property. I have already considered these effects in my evidence (see paragraphs 125 127). For completeness, I have provided additional comment in **Appendix 1** to this statement.
- Having considered the points raised in submissions, I continue to hold the opinion that the Proposed Village is appropriate in its context and will result in positive effects in relation to the established urban landscape. Adverse visual effects will be, at most, low when viewed from a limited number of surrounding

properties. Amendments to the Landscape Concept Plan address concerns raised by submitters about planting along the southern boundary of the Site.

Council Officer's Report

- 14 Ms Angela McArthur for the Council is in general agreement with my LVA. I respond to a number of detailed matters raised, particularly in relation to recommended amendments to planting.
- In relation to other matters addressed in the Officer's Report, I also draw attention to the need to carefully consider methods used to mitigate wind effects and the impact of such mitigation on public realm amenity and safety. I am satisfied this matter can be appropriately managed through the detailed landscape plan process, with appropriate inputs from a suitably qualified landscape architect and wind specialist.
- Overall, Ms McArthur and I are in agreement that the Site is suitable to accommodate the Proposed Village and the limited adverse landscape and visual effects can be effectively mitigated.

Updated drawings

17 I confirm that I have reviewed the updated drawings and descriptions of the changes to the drawings lodged in the memorandum dated 11 September 2022. The changes to *Drawing RCA98a Landscaping Plan* are consistent with my recommendations. All other changes do not alter my previous assessment and conclusions.

Draft Conditions

- I recommend minor changes to Condition 57, which addresses the elements of the Landscape and Pavement Plan, to:
 - 18.1 Refer to the updated Landscaping Plan;
 - 18.2 Remove the second bullet point as the updated Landscaping Plan shows a suitable interface with adjacent properties to the south; and
 - 18.3 Remove the fifth bullet point referring to the minimum height of planting on the roof top terraces.

Rebecca Skidmore 13 September 2022

APPENDIX 1 - RESPONSE TO AMENDED SUBMISSION 67

- 1 An amended submission has been received from Ms Lina and Mr Cheng Hao. They own the property at 40 Campbell Street and raise concerns about the visual effect of the Proposed Village when viewed from their property. In particular, they raise concerns about the location of the vehicular entrance from Campbell Street.
- 2 As shown on Drawing RCA13, the property at 40 Campbell Street is located to the south of the vehicular entrance rather than opposite, as described in the submission. The dwelling at this property is set back from the front boundary with a garage located at the street front. Together with vegetation in the front garden and adjacent street, the garage screens views towards the Site. In addition, and as set out in my earlier assessment, Campbell Street provides suitable separation to avoid over-dominance when viewed from this property. In my opinion, adverse visual effects experienced from this property will at most be low, reducing to very low as the street boundary planting becomes established.