

**Absolutely Positively
Wellington City Council**

Me Heke Ki Pōneke

Ordinary Meeting of Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee Ngā Meneti | Minutes

9:30 am Rāpare, 5 Hakihea 2024
9:30 am Thursday, 5 December 2024
Ngake (16.09), Level 16, Tahiwī
113 The Terrace
Pōneke | Wellington



PRESENT

Mayor Whanau
Deputy Mayor Foon
Councillor Abdurahman
Councillor Apanowicz
Councillor Brown (Chair)
Councillor Calvert
Councillor Chung (via audiovisual link)
Councillor Free
Pouiwi Hohaia
Pouiwi Kelly
Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair)
Councillor McNulty
Councillor O'Neill
Councillor Pannett
Councillor Randle
Councillor Rogers
Councillor Wi Neera (via audiovisual link)
Councillor Young

TABLE OF CONTENTS

5 DECEMBER 2024

| Business | Page No. |
|---|-----------------|
| <hr/> | |
| 1. Meeting Conduct | 4 |
| 1.1 Karakia | 4 |
| 1.2 Apologies | 4 |
| 1.3 Conflict of Interest Declarations | 4 |
| 1.4 Confirmation of Minutes | 4 |
| 1.5 Items not on the Agenda | 4 |
| 1.6 Public Participation | 4 |
| 2. General Business | 4 |
| 2.1 Te Awarua o Porirua Whakaritenga – Porirua Harbour Accord | 5 |
| 2.2 City to Sea Bridge and Capital E | 6 |
| 2.3 NoM - Island Bay Library Car Park | 14 |
| 2.4 Housing Action Plan 6-monthly Report | 17 |
| 2.5 Te Atakura 2024 Update Report | 18 |
| 2.6 Decision register updates and upcoming reports | 18 |

1. Meeting Conduct

1.1 Karakia

The Chairperson declared the meeting (hui) open at 9:30am and read the following karakia to open the hui.

**Whakataka te hau ki te uru,
Whakataka te hau ki te tonga.
Kia mākinakina ki uta,
Kia mātaratara ki tai.
E hī ake ana te atākura.
He tio, he huka, he hauhū.
Tihei Mauri Ora!**

Cease oh winds of the west
and of the south
Let the bracing breezes flow,
over the land and the sea.
Let the red-tipped dawn come
with a sharpened edge, a touch of frost,
a promise of a glorious day

1.2 Apologies

No apologies were received.

1.3 Conflict of Interest Declarations

No conflicts of interest were declared.

1.4 Confirmation of Minutes

Moved Councillor Brown, seconded Councillor Matthews

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Approves the minutes of the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee Meeting held on 17 October 2024, having been circulated, that they be taken as read and confirmed as an accurate record of that meeting.

Carried

1.5 Items not on the Agenda

There were no items not on the agenda.

1.6 Public Participation

1.6.1 Bruce McLean

Addressed the meeting regarding item 2.2.

1.6.2 Felicity Wong on behalf of Historic Places Wellington

Addressed the meeting regarding item 2.2.

1.6.3 Jon Devine

Addressed the meeting regarding item 2.2.

1.6.4 ANGELA FOSTER

ADDRESSED THE MEETING REGARDING ITEM 2.2.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ATTACHMENTS ATTACHMENTS

1 FELICITY WONG - ATTACHMENT - CITY TO SEA BRIDGE

2. GENERAL BUSINESS

2.1 Te Awarua o Porirua Whakaritenga – Porirua Harbour Accord Moved Liz Kelly, seconded Councillor McNulty the following motion

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the report.
2. Endorse Te Awarua o Porirua Whakaritenga – Porirua Harbour Accord
3. Agrees in principle to the Programme Monitoring Framework.
4. Agrees to future development of a mauri ora approach to guide the restoration and monitoring of the Porirua Harbour's health.
5. Agrees to the steps required for the formal signing of Te Awarua o Porirua Whakaritenga – Porirua Harbour Accord.
6. Instruct Officers to bring an item to the governance group formed under the Porirua Harbour Accord setting out the terms and process for a review the Watercourse Agreement for the Porirua Stream to ensure a clear delineation of responsibilities (including that of any new regional water entity) to enhance the wellbeing and management of the stream given its status as a major tributary into the Porirua Harbour.

Carried

Secretarial Note: The motion moved was different to the recommendations in the officers report, the changes are marked in red.

A division was called for under Standing Order 27.6(b), voting on which was as follows:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Nil

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 17:0

Carried

The meeting adjourned at 10:28am and returned at 10:40am with the following members present: Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, , Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Pouwi Hohaia, Pouwi Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Young.

(Councillor Apanowicz rejoined the hui at 10:45am)
(Councillor Wi Neera rejoined the hui at 10:47am)
(Councillor Apanowicz left the hui at 11:05am)
(Councillor Apanowicz rejoined the hui at 11:08am)
(Councillor Matthews left the hui at 11:24am)
(Councillor Matthews rejoined the hui at 11:25am)
(Councillor McNulty left the hui at 11:26am)

The meeting adjourned at 11:28am and returned at 11:35am with the following members present: Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Councillor Free, Pouiwi Hohaia, Pouiwi Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young.

(Deputy Mayor Foon rejoined the hui at 11:36am)
(Councillor O'Neill rejoined the hui at 11:37am)

The meeting adjourned at 11:55am and returned at 12:03pm with all members present.

2.2 City to Sea Bridge and Capital E

Moved Councillor Brown, seconded Councillor Matthews the following motion

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the information
2. Note that the Council has now completed consultation with the community on:
 - a. Te Ngākau Development Plan and scenarios to guide the future development of the precinct; and
 - b. Options for the City to Sea Bridge and Capital E sites
3. Note that feedback on the Development Plan will be used as part of advice to the Council when relevant decisions are taken on future projects; there are no immediate decisions required or implications from the consultation feedback
4. Note that officers will bring the Development Plan back to the Council for finalisation next year, with the Council's decision on the City to Sea Bridge and Capital E incorporated
5. Note officers have considered the following options for the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E:
 - a. Option 1 (short-term preferred): demolish the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E and replace with an at-grade crossing;
 - b. Option 2 (long-term preferred): demolish the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E and replace with an at-grade crossing and a new bridge;
 - c. Option 3 (not preferred): Full strengthening of the City to Sea Bridge/demolish Capital E, replace with abutment;
 - d. Option 3a (not preferred): minimum strengthening of the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E/seawall;
 - e. Option 3b (not preferred): demolish Capital E, replace with abutment/do nothing on the City to Sea Bridge and seawall
 - f. Option 4 (not preferred): Do nothing.

6. Note that community feedback on the City to Sea Bridge was split as follows:
 - a. 57.5% of submitters supported the demolition of the bridge/Capital E and the replacement with either an at-grade crossing (23%) or a replacement bridge (34%)
 - b. 39% submitters did not support either option
7. Agree that the Council:
 - a. proceeds with Option 1, with design of the crossing informed by the Te Ngākau Development Plan; and
 - b. Explores funding Option 2 – a replacement bridge – through the 2027-37 LTP subject to financial feasibility
8. Note that the Town Hall loading dock strengthening forms part of the project and, to ensure work is completed in time for Town Hall completion, demolition work would begin in January 2025, with the project completed by end of 2026.
9. Direct officers to engage collaboratively with the architecture and design communities, in addition to Mana Whenua and already identified stakeholders, on the future for Te Ngākau Civic Square once Capital E and the City to Sea Bridge are removed.
10. Direct officers to report back with advice on whether the pedestrian crossing at St Johns could be removed once a new crossing is added at Te Ngākau Civic Square and if so, appropriate placement to maximise pedestrian safety and experience.
11. Agree to make decisions around the Michael Fowler Centre aligned with Government seismic regulatory reforms and that officers provide regular updates on the progress of the reforms.

Secretarial Note: The motion moved was different to the recommendations in the officers report, the changes are marked in red.

Moved Councillor Pannett, seconded Councillor Young the following amendment

- ~~7. Agree that the Council:~~
 - ~~a. proceeds with Option 1, with design of the crossing informed by the Te Ngākau Development Plan; and~~
 - ~~b. Explores funding Option 2 – a replacement bridge – through the 2027-37 LTP subject to financial feasibility~~
12. Agree work on the Town Hall loading dock and the critical Capital E wall should proceed urgently in a cost-effective manner to meet the completion deadlines set out in the paper
13. Defer all other recommendations contained within this paper until the committee meeting of 20 February 2025 to;
 1. allow staff (working with designers, architects and engineers) to enable further due diligence of the information
 2. develop a cost-effective solution to strengthen the City to Sea bridge.
14. Support, in principle, having a bridge between Te Ngākau Civic Square and the waterfront rather than an at-grade solution.

Lost

Secretarial Note: Voting was taken in parts with all clauses being taken separately. All clauses lost.

A division was called for under Standing Order 27.6(b), voting on which was as follows:

Clause 12:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor Rogers

Majority Vote: 9:9

Lost

Secretarial note: The vote being tied, the chairperson applied their casting vote against the motion.

Clause 13 and 13.1:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers

Majority Vote: 8:10

Lost

Clause 13.2:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers

Majority Vote: 7:11

Lost

Clause 14:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers

Majority Vote: 8:10

Lost

The meeting adjourned at 1:02pm and returned at 1:16pm with the following members present: Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Councillor Free, Pouwi Hohaia, Pouwi Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers.

(Deputy Mayor Foon rejoined the hui at 1:17pm)
(Councillor Young rejoined the hui at 1:17pm)
(Councillor O'Neill rejoined the hui at 1:17pm)
(Mayor Whanau left the hui at 1:39pm)
(Mayor Whanau rejoined the hui at 1:40pm)

Moved Councillor Brown, seconded Councillor Matthews the following substantive motion

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the information
2. Note that the Council has now completed consultation with the community on:
 - a. Te Ngākau Development Plan and scenarios to guide the future development of the precinct; and
 - b. Options for the City to Sea Bridge and Capital E sites
3. Note that feedback on the Development Plan will be used as part of advice to the Council when relevant decisions are taken on future projects; there are no immediate decisions required or implications from the consultation feedback
4. Note that officers will bring the Development Plan back to the Council for finalisation next year, with the Council's decision on the City to Sea Bridge and Capital E incorporated
5. Note officers have considered the following options for the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E:
 - a. Option 1 (short-term preferred): demolish the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E and replace with an at-grade crossing;
 - b. Option 2 (long-term preferred): demolish the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E and replace with an at-grade crossing and a new bridge;
 - c. Option 3 (not preferred): Full strengthening of the City to Sea Bridge/demolish Capital E, replace with abutment;
 - d. Option 3a (not preferred): minimum strengthening of the City to Sea Bridge/Capital E/seawall;

- e. Option 3b (not preferred): demolish Capital E, replace with abutment/do nothing on the City to Sea Bridge and seawall
 - f. Option 4 (not preferred): Do nothing.
- 6. Note that community feedback on the City to Sea Bridge was split as follows:
 - a. 57.5% of submitters supported the demolition of the bridge/Capital E and the replacement with either an at-grade crossing (23%) or a replacement bridge (34%)
 - b. 39% submitters did not support either option
- 7. Agree that the Council:
 - a. proceeds with Option 1, with design of the crossing informed by the Te Ngākau Development Plan; and
 - b. Explores funding Option 2 – a replacement bridge – through the 2027-37 LTP subject to financial feasibility
- 8. Note that the Town Hall loading dock strengthening forms part of the project and, to ensure work is completed in time for Town Hall completion, demolition work would begin in January 2025, with the project completed by end of 2026.
- 9. Direct officers to engage collaboratively with the architecture and design communities, in addition to Mana Whenua and already identified stakeholders, on the future for Te Ngākau Civic Square once Capital E and the City to Sea Bridge are removed.
- 10. Direct officers to report back with advice on whether the pedestrian crossing at St Johns could be removed once a new crossing is added at Te Ngākau Civic Square and if so, appropriate placement to maximise pedestrian safety and experience.
- 11. Agree to make decisions around the Michael Fowler Centre aligned with Government seismic regulatory reforms and that officers provide regular updates on the progress of the reforms.

Carried

Secretarial Note: Voting was taken in parts with all clauses being taken separately. All clauses were carried.

A division was called for under Standing Order 27.6(b), voting on which was as follows:

Clause 1:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 16:1

Carried

Clause 2:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

Clause 3:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 12:5

Carried

Clause 4:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 12:5

Carried

Clause 5:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

Clause 6:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

Clause 7:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers

Against:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 11:6

Carried

Clause 8:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

Clause 9:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Calvert, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

Clause 10:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Deputy Mayor Foon, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Calvert, Councillor Free, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 12:5

Carried

Clause 11:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Nil

Absent:

Councillor Chung

Majority Vote: 17:0

Carried

The meeting adjourned at 1:56pm and returned at 2:02pm with the following members present: Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Apanowicz, Councillor Brown, Councillor Chung, Councillor Free, Pouwi Hohaia, Pouwi Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera.

(Councillor Young rejoined the hui at 2:03pm)
(Deputy Mayor Foon rejoined the hui at 2:03pm)
(Councillor O'Neill rejoined the hui at 2:03pm)
(Councillor Calvert rejoined the hui at 2:04pm)
(Councillor Randle rejoined the hui at 2:04pm)

The meeting adjourned at 2:13pm and returned at 2:19pm with all members present.

(Councillor Apanowicz left the hui at 2:51pm)

2.3 NoM - Island Bay Library Car Park

Moved Councillor Abdurahman, seconded Councillor McNulty

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. **Agree** to convert the vacant land (former Plunket site) behind the Island Bay library into a ~~P120~~ car park to support local ~~community and businesses (including the pharmacy, medical centre, restaurants, takeaway shops, the cinema, and cafes)~~ **at the lowest possible cost to Council**, until its future use is decided in Te Awe Māpara action F12.
2. **Agree** to use up to half of the unused budget from the Berhampore and Island Bay beautification fund (2021 Long-Term Plan) for additional place making (temporary parking improvements) at the former Plunket site behind the Island Bay library.
3. **Note:** The land behind the Island Bay Library is owned by Wellington City Council (WCC) and currently vacant / has been used as a lot by WCC contractors working on the beautification project.
4. **Note:** The future of this site will be considered as part of Te Awe Māpara action F12 - Island Bay facility provision. This action has not been scheduled yet but will be looked at in the coming years.

Carried

Secretarial Note: The notice of motion was altered with the agreement of the mover and the majority of those present at the meeting in accordance with standing order 23.5, changes are shown in red and strikethrough.

Secretarial Note: A point of order was raised by Councillor O'Neill to request the recording of words during debate by Councillor Randle in accordance with standing order 26.5(f), the wording is as follows: "We always make these hard decisions".

Voting was taken in parts with all clauses taken separately. All clauses were carried.

A division was called for under Standing Order 27.6(b), voting on which was as follows:

Clauses 1:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor McNulty, Councillor Randle, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 9:8

Carried

Clause 2:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 9:8

Carried

Clause 3:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Wi Neera

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 12:5

Carried

Clause 4:

For:

Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown, Councillor Calvert, Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Councillor Matthews, Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Young

Against:

Mayor Whanau, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Wi Neera

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

2.4 Housing Action Plan 6-monthly Report

Moved Councillor Rogers, seconded Liz Kelly

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the information.
2. Note the updates included in the third six-monthly Housing Action Plan 2023-25 Report Dashboard.
3. **Direct officers to investigate opportunities to incentivise the conversion of office to apartment buildings inside and outside of the Te Kainga programme through rates, developer contributions, and other tools.**

Carried

Secretarial Note: The motion moved was different to the recommendations in the officers report, the changes are marked in red.

Voting was taken in parts with clause 3 taken separately. All clauses were carried.

A division was called for under Standing Order 27.6(b), voting on which was as follows:

Clause 1 and 2:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Calvert, Deputy Mayor Foon, Councillor Free, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Randle, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera, Councillor Young

Against:

Councillor Chung

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 16:1

Carried

Clause 3:

For:

Mayor Whanau, Councillor Abdurahman, Councillor Brown (Chair), Councillor Chung, Deputy Mayor Foon, Holden Hohaia, Liz Kelly, Councillor Matthews (Deputy Chair), Councillor McNulty, Councillor O'Neill, Councillor Pannett, Councillor Rogers, Councillor Wi Neera

Against:

Councillor Calvert, Councillor Free, Councillor Randle, Councillor Young

Absent:

Councillor Apanowicz

Majority Vote: 13:4

Carried

(Councillor O'Neill left the hui at 3:15pm)
(Councillor O'Neill rejoined the hui at 3:15pm)
(Councillor Matthews left the hui at 3:16pm)
(Councillor Matthews rejoined the hui at 3:17pm)
(Councillor Abdurahman left the hui at 3:18pm)
(Councillor Apanowicz rejoined the hui at 3:20pm)
(Councillor Abdurahman rejoined the hui at 3:22pm)
(Councillor McNulty left the hui at 3:25pm)

Moved Councillor O'Neill, seconded Deputy Mayor Foon

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Extend the meeting beyond six hours, in accordance with standing order 11.7.

Carried

(Councillor McNulty rejoined the hui at 3:30pm)

2.5 Te Atakura 2024 Update Report

Moved Deputy Mayor Foon, seconded Councillor O'Neill

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the information.
2. Note that Appendix 1 of the *2024 Update* outlines the actions from the *Implementation Plan* that have budget allocation in the *2024 Long-term Plan*.
3. Note that the city emissions inventory data for 2023/24 has not yet been confirmed by Aecom, and that publication of the *2024 Update* will follow this confirmation (expected by mid-December).

Carried

2.6 Decision register updates and upcoming reports

Moved Councillor Brown, seconded Councillor Matthews

Resolved

That the Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee:

1. Receive the information.

Carried

The hui concluded at 3:39pm with the reading of the following karakia:

| | |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| Unuhia, unuhia, unuhia ki te uru tapu nui | Draw on, draw on |
| Kia wātea, kia māmā, te ngākau, te tinana, | Draw on the supreme sacredness |
| te wairua | To clear, to free the heart, the body |
| I te ara takatū | and the spirit of mankind |
| Koia rā e Rongo, whakairia ake ki runga | Oh Rongo, above (symbol of peace) |
| Kia wātea, kia wātea | Let this all be done in unity |
| Āe rā, kua wātea! | |

Authenticated: _____
Chair

Ordinary Meeting of Kōrau Tūāpapa | Environment and Infrastructure Committee

Minute item attachments

9:30 am Thursday, 5 December 2024
Ngake (16.09), Level 16, Tahiwi
113 The Terrace
Pōneke | Wellington

| Business | Page No. |
|----------|----------|
|----------|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| Public Participation Attachments | |
| 1. Felicity Wong - Attachment - City to Sea Bridge | 2 |

240545 2024-12-04 city to sea bridge.docx

4th December 2024

Richard Burrell
Email: richard@building-solutions.co.nz



Dear Richard

City to Sea Bridge, Jervois Quay, Wellington Detailed Seismic Assessment Review

Spencer Holmes Limited has undertaken a review of the Detailed Seismic Assessment (DSA) on the City to Sea Bridge prepared by Hoff Consultants Limited (Hoffcon) dated 26 June 2024, and provide the following comments on the DSA.

Background

Spencer Holmes Limited undertook a seismic assessment on the bridge in 2010, and designed a practical securing/ strengthening to the bridge to provide more resilience to the original structural system. Steel braces were installed on the city side of the bridge to reduce the torsional response of the bridge and strengthen the diaphragm and connections.

The Hoffcon DSA finds the bridge to have an earthquake rating of 20%NBS (IL3). This rating has had a “step change” factor of 0.5 applied to it.

From media reports, the Wellington City Council concern appears to be related to the seismic resilience of Jervois Quay after a major seismic event.

Importance Level

The Importance Level (IL) for the bridge is defined within the Waka Kotahi New Zealand Transport Agency Bridge Manual (NZTA Bridge Manual) to be IL2, as it is a footbridge. This is the IL for a “normal structure” as defined in AS/NZS1170.0, the New Zealand loading standard.

In referring to the NZTA Bridge Manual, even with the bridge crossing an Arterial Road (as Jervois Quay is nominated in the One Network Road Classification) the bridge would still be defined as an IL2 bridge.

The Importance Level noted in the Hoffcon report is IL3, based on the criteria from NZS1170.0 that “more than 300 people can congregate in one area.” This is not the usual function of the bridge, and this criteria is triggered, if at all, less than a handful of occasions per annum. This criteria may be used for the design of a new structure, however, we consider that using this to assess an existing structure within a risk and life safety framework to be very conservative and misleading. We note that the usage of the bridge could be controlled by the Wellington City Council.

Spencer Holmes Limited

Directors: Mark Cooney, Jon Devine, Ian Leary, Philip McConchie, Shayne McKenna, Hayden Milburn
Technical Director: John McNaughton
Associates: Simon Conway, Jo Cushen, Cameron de Leijer, David Gibson, Thomas Smith, Rowan Tailby
Consultants: Hudson Moody, Peter Smith

An IL3 structure has a Return Period factor of 1.3, ie the seismic loadings are 1.3 times that of a comparable IL2 structure.

Liquefaction

The DSA is supported by a Desktop Geotechnical Seismic Assessment by Tonkin and Taylor, dated 24 June 2024. This report notes that liquefaction is triggered at 35-40%NBS (IL3).

When liquefaction has been triggered, then an additional factor is applied to the probable capacity of elements of the structure that would be considered a severe structural weakness. This is a step change factor of 2 which is applied to the %NBS score of that element, ie the score of a structural connection or element is reduced by a factor of 2.

Section C4 Geotechnical Considerations of The Seismic Assessment of Existing Buildings (2017) does note that very few sites will result in a true step change in behaviour. The desktop assessment may be conservative for a step change to be applied to this structure without a more thorough assessment by the Geotechnical Engineer.

It should be noted that first liquefaction is triggered at a level of 35-40%NBS (IL3), or approx. 45-50%NBS (IL2) using the 1.3 factor as noted in the previous section. This is at a higher level of seismic shaking than the assessed earthquake rating of the bridge by Hoffcon.

The step change factor should only be applied to an element when liquefaction has been initiated.

Adjusted DSA Rating

Therefore, the earthquake rating for the bridge should be adjusted as follows;

$$20\%NBS \times 1.3 \text{ (IL2 adjustment)} \times 2 \text{ (removing the step change adjustment)} =$$

Approx. 50%NBS (IL2)

We note that this is also the approximate level that liquefaction is initiated, making this the suitable rating at which the bridge remains stable. We are of the opinion that the bridge does not meet the criteria for an earthquake prone building.

In a major seismic event, should the bridge cause disruption to Jervois Quay, then this is likely due to failure of the sea wall, combined with liquefaction and lateral spread. The disruption to Jervois Quay would be a likely outcome that would occur regardless of the performance of the bridge, or if the bridge has already been demolished.

Should you have any questions regarding this matter, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Yours faithfully
Spencer Holmes Limited



Jon Devine
Director CPEng